

To: Renate Behrens, Chair, RDA Steering Committee
 From: Anne Welsh, RSC Secretary
 Subject: Formal responses to RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev – Proposal on Dual-language naming of Corporate Body and Place

This document collates in tabular form the responses received from voting members of the RSC to [RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev](#), viz.:

- [RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev/EOO](#)
- [RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev/EURIG response](#)
- [RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev/ExamplesEditor](#)
- [RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev/NARDAC response](#)
- [RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev/TranslationsTLO](#)
- [RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev/TTWG Response](#)
- [RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev/WCEO response](#)

Recommendation 1	Approved by 6 : EOO , EURIG , Examples Editor , TranslationsTLO , TTWG , WCEO Approved with suggested edits by 1 : NARDAC	Note 1: NARDAC suggests two alternative forms of wording for discussion by the RSC. Note 4: NARDAC suggests several examples outside New Zealand for the Examples Editor to incorporate.
Recommendation 2	Approved by 6 : EOO , EURIG , Examples Editor , TranslationsTLO , TTWG , WCEO Approved with suggested edits by 1 : NARDAC	Note 2: NARDAC suggests a different location for the Condition Option. Note 3: NARDAC suggests alternative wording. Note 4: NARDAC suggests several examples outside New Zealand for the Examples Editor to incorporate.

Note 1

In [RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev](#) the following wording is suggested:

Marked-up copy

Names of corporate body in two or more languagesCONDITION

A value of a name consists of words in two or more languages.

CONDITION OPTION

Record a value as a single string as it appears on the source of information.

...

NARDAC recommends instead the following working (mark-up based on the text in the proposal, quoted above):

CONDITION

A single value of a name ~~consists of words~~ includes in two or more languages in manifestations.

CONDITION OPTION

Record a value as a single string as it appears on the source of information.

The rationale for adding “in manifestations” is to parallel use in the other Condition / Condition Options under the same heading in the element page.

The Library of Congress made the following suggestion. I assume that this was not agreed by the rest of NARDAC, hence its being offered separately (?).

“The proposed new Condition Option mentions “single string” without that being mentioned in the Condition. LC thinks it would be clearer if that wording was also part of the Condition. LC notes that the phrase “single string” appears nowhere else in RDA.” Here NARDA has interpolated “NARDAC notes that this also applies to Recommendation 2”.

The Library of Congress comment continues:

“A clear differentiation is needed from Guidelines on normalized transcription: [Letters or words intended to be read two or more times](#) which addresses phrases such as “Postes Canada Post” and permits them to be transcribed as parallel data.”

Here is the Condition Option ([33.19.34.05](#)) and its Example ([77.51.95.90](#)):

Letters or words intended to be read two or more times

CONDITION

A letter or word appears only once but is intended to be read two or more times.

CONDITION OPTION

Repeat the letter or word.

Example

Canadian citations

Citations canadiennes

Recording method: unstructured description

Source of information reads: Canadian CITATIONS canadiennes.

Intended readings recorded separately as title proper and parallel title proper.

The Library of Congress comment continues:

“In the New Zealand dual-name examples, LC’s understanding is the words are only intended to be read once and do not represent parallel data.

Combining all these concerns, LC wonders if something like this would work (mark-up based on differences from the wording RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev):

CONDITION

A value of a name appears in manifestations as a single string, consists of containing words in two or more languages, intended to be read together as a single value.

CONDITION OPTION

Record a value as a single string as it appears on the source of information.

For ease of choice, here are the three forms of wording

ORDAC:

CONDITION

A value of a name consists of words in two or more languages.

NARDAC:

CONDITION

A single value of a name consists of words includes in two or more languages in manifestations.

LC:

CONDITION

A value of a name appears in manifestations as a single string, consists of containing words in two or more languages, intended to be read together as a single value.

Note 2

RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev suggests the following location for the new Condition and Condition Option:

“directly under the heading [Language](#), preceding the [Condition](#) *A name of place is in two or more languages.*”

NARDAC points out that [Language](#) “is a sub-section under ‘Different names for the same place’” – i.e. [87.31.22.54](#). NARDAC makes the point that this may “contradict the arguments in the proposal that these New Zealand dual-[language] names are considered a single name for a place, with the English words being just a part of the name.”

To aid in the discussion of the best place for the new Condition and Condition Option, here is the current contents list for Entities>Place>preferred name of place>Recording an unstructured description ([65.60.25.13](#)):

- Different names for the same place
 - Two or more names appears[*] in sources
 - Language
 - Name of place in a non-preferred script
 - Names that include a category of corporate body
- Data provenance

* Editorial note from Secretary to herself: correct typo “appears” to “appear” – heading itself is fine; solely the contents list is affected.

Note 3

In [RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev](#) the following wording is suggested:

Marked-up copy

CONDITION

A name of place consists of words in two or more languages

CONDITION OPTION

Record a value as a single string as it appears on the source of information

NARDAC recommends the following wording (mark-up based on the text in the proposal, quoted above):

CONDITION

A single value of a name of place ~~consists of words~~ includes ~~in~~ two or more languages in manifestations.

As in **Note 1**, the rationale for adding “in manifestations” is to parallel use in the other Condition / Condition Options under the same heading in the element page.

Note 4

The NARDAC response includes an Appendix of suggested examples for the Examples Editor to consider:

Four corporate bodies from Canada:

- Éditions Brimar Publishing Inc.
- Éditions Bloc-notes Publishing Inc.
- Disques Pyrrhic Records Inc.
- Mont Royal Records Inc./Les Disques Mont-Royal Inc.

Place name from Switzerland:

- Biel/Bienne [see <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Biel/Bienne>]