

MINUTES
July 2024 RSC MEETING
Asynchronous, via Basecamp and Zoom
15-18 July 2024

Attending: Colleen Barbus, RDA Board Chair
Renate Behrens, RSC Chair
Charlene Chou, RSC Wider Community Engagement Officer
Charlotte Christensen, RSC Oceania representative
Ahava Cohen, RSC Europe representative
Szabolcs Dancs, RSC Translations Team Liaison Officer
Jessica Grzegorski, RDA Examples Editor
James Hennelly, Director, ALA Digital Reference (RDA publisher)
Damian Iseminger, RSC Technical Team Liaison Officer
Robert Maxwell, RSC North America representative
Elisa Sze, RSC Education and Orientation Officer
Anne Welsh, RSC Secretary

Apologies: Charlene Chou was unable to attend the Public Session on 16 July

Invited (Public Session on 16 July only)
speaker: Thomas Brenndorfer, Chair of the Extent Working Group

Observers Jack Ennis-Butler, Back-up Oceania Representative

(Public Session on 16 July only):

Sue Andrews, Canada
Dominique Bourassa, USA
Emma Clarkson, USA
Deborah Fritz, USA
Britannia Gammond, Canada
Alissa Ho, Australia
Bridget Jennings, New Zealand
Ed Jones, USA
Ebe Kartus, New Zealand
Honor Moody, USA
Olivera Nastić, Serbia
Daniel Paradis, Canada
Ángela Quiroz Ubierna, Chile
Pat Riva, Canada

Adam Schiff, USA
Amanda Sprochi, USA
Pamela Thomas, USA
Thurstan Young, UK

Item numbering continues from the previous meeting.

CONTENTS

Executive Session

[469 Welcome, catching up and review of past action items](#)

[470 Working Groups](#)

[471 Fast Track Proposals](#)

[472 Policies for Management of the Community Resources Section](#)

[473 Slides for Educators](#)

[482 AOB \(Any Other Business\) and thanks from the Chair](#)

Public Session

[469 Welcome – Renate Behrens](#)

[474 RSC/ORDAC/2024/1: updates from Charlotte Christensen, Oceania Representative, and Jessica Grzegorski, Examples Editor](#)

[475 RSC/ReligionsWG/2024/1 – Proposal to Revise Name of Corporate Body](#)

[476 RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1 – Discussion Paper on the Development of Extent Elements in RDA](#)

[477 ALA Digital Reference – James Hennelly](#)

[478 Update on Working Groups – Renate Behrens and Working Group Chairs](#)

[479 Update from Regional Representatives and Wider Community Engagement Officer](#)

[480 Update from the Education and Orientation Officer](#)

[481 Cooperations – Renate Behrens](#)

[482 AOB \(Any Other Business\) and Thanks from the Chair](#)

Executive Session

469 Welcome, catching up and review of past action items

469.1 Welcome

RSC Chair Renate Behrens opened both the Executive Session on 15 July and the Public Session on 16 July by offering a warm welcome. In the Public Session, she passed on apologies from Charlene Chou, the Wider Community Engagement Officer, who is in China on a Fellowship visit. She asked each member of the RSC to introduce themselves, then outlined the way that the meeting would be structured. For each topic, she would ask RSC members for comments first and then open to observers, from whom she warmly welcomed questions and comments.

469.2 Review of past action items

All actions from the previous meeting have been completed or are in progress.

470 Working Groups

470.1 Task and Finish Working Groups

470.1.1 The Religions in RDA Working Group has provided a proposal for discussion at the Public Session ([Item 475, RSC/ReligionsWG/2024/1](#)).

470.1.2 The Extent Working Group has provided a Discussion Paper for discussion in the November RSC Meeting ([Item 476, RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1](#)).

470.1.3 The Executive Working Group was keen to see some discussion in this meeting of the **Archives Working Group**'s proposed tasks, so that a call for participants can be drafted. There was brief discussion of this topic. The Chair is keen for the call for participants to be issued ahead of the next RSC Meeting (November 2024).

470.1.3.1 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to prepare DRAFT document for next Executive Group Meeting.

470.1.3.2 ACTION ITEM: Chair and Secretary to add to agenda of next Executive Group Meeting.

470.1.3.3 ACTION ITEM: Executive Group to agree a DRAFT to be circulated to the rest of the RSC (Regional Representatives).

470.1.3.4 ACTION ITEM: Basic charge to be agreed as soon as possible by RSC members and then call for participants issued by Secretary.

470.2 Examples Working Group

The Examples Editor, Jessica Grzegorski, who is the Chair of the Examples Working Group, provided a brief update on activities since the last RSC Meeting in April.

470.2.1 New Examples

The Working Group has created a variety of examples for several elements in the RDA Toolkit (see July Release Notes for full details, [when they are published](#)). They prioritised the review and addition of examples for dual-language corporate bodies and names of places in the *preferred name of corporate body* and *preferred name of place* elements in response to discussions around ORDAC's proposal on dual-language naming of corporate body and place ([RSC/Minutes/456-468](#) Item 462). The Working Group added examples suggested by ORDAC in its original proposal ([RSC/ORDAC/2024/1](#)) and response ([RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/summary/ORDAC](#)) alongside other examples of different kinds of corporate body:

preferred name of corporate body

Marked-up text only:

OPTION

Record a value of Corporate Body: [name of corporate body](#).

Example

Chartered Institute of Library and Information Professionals

Recording method: unstructured description

Turizm Yazarlar ve Gazeteciler Derneği

Recording method: unstructured description

Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga

Recording method: unstructured description

Appears on the source of information as a single name incorporating words from two different languages that are not meant to be direct translations from one language into the other

preferred name of place

Marked-up text only:

OPTION

Record a value of Place: [name of place](#)

Example

Santiago de Chile

Recording method: unstructured description

Grand Rapids

Recording method: unstructured description

The Hague

Recording method: unstructured description

English is the preferred language of the agent creating the metadata

Uluru/Ayers Rock

Recording method: unstructured description

Appears on the source of information as a single name incorporating words from two different languages

[...]

CONDITION OPTION

Record (in this order of preference):

1. the form of the name found in a gazetteer or another *source of information* in a language preferred by the agent who creates the metadata
2. the form of the name found in a gazetteer or another *source of information* issued in the jurisdiction in which the place is located in the official language or languages of the government of the jurisdiction.

Example

The Hague

Recording method: unstructured description

Also appears as Den Haag in source of information. The preferred language of the agent creating the metadata is English.

Aoraki/Mount Cook

Recording method: unstructured description

Appears in official gazetteer issued in jurisdiction in which the place is located in one of the official languages of the jurisdiction as a single name incorporating words from two different languages

470.2.2 Development of Full Examples

The Examples Editor met with James Hennelly to discuss the presentation of full RDA examples in the Toolkit, with reference to the [full record examples on the RDA website](#). These developments will be discussed within the Working Group.

470.2.3 Updated Charge Document

Gabriele Göser recently rotated off of the Working Group, and we thank her for her time, effort, and service. We are pleased to welcome Laura Doublet to the Examples Working Group for a two-year term. The voting members of the RSC ratified RSC/Chair/2024/13, which replaces [RSC/Chair/2024/2](#) and differs from it solely in the list of members.

470.2.3.1 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to publish RSC/Chair/2024/13.

470.2.3.2 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to [update members list on website](#).

470.3 Technical Working Group

The Technical Team Liaison Officer, Damian Iseminger, who is the Chair of the Technical Working Group, gave a brief update on activities since the last RSC Meeting in April, including providing RSC members with an overview of proposals on which they are working. FT2024-08 (submitted with the Education and Orientation Officer) is under discussion in this meeting ([Item 471.2](#)). The Working Group has also been discussing the possibility of providing SCHACL files that can be used in validating data produced using RDA. The Technical Team Liaison Officer has been working with the Director of ALA Digital Reference to develop a SPARQL endpoint for RDA. The next step will be to take the steps necessary to put this into production, but this will take a little time.

470.3.1 Succession Planning

The Technical Team Liaison Officer has been working with the Technical Working Group to find his successor. As set out in [RSC/Operations/1](#) section 3.2, the first stage is that “The RSC Chair will approach the Technical Working Group to seek applications.” As there are applicants from within Technical Working Group, the next stage will be for them to meet with the Chair, Secretary and the Director of ALA Digital Working Group.

470.3.1.1 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to set up meeting(s).

470.4 Translations Working Group

The Translations Team Liaison Officer, Szabolcs Dancs, who is the Chair of the Translations Working Group, provided a brief update on activities since the last RSC Meeting in April. He highlighted the translators’ meeting which took place at the annual EURIG meeting in May; the Spanish translation of RDA Reference; and the update of the RDA Translations wiki and the resources folder on Google Drive. A refresher on the translation process is planned in July.

470.4.1 Article in *CeLISR* 1 (2024)

The Translations Team Liaison Officer is the Editor of the *Central European Library and Information Science Review (CeLISR)* and shared that the current issue includes an article by the RSC Chair entitled ‘Internationalisation of Cataloguing in Cultural Institutions with RDA Using the example of the German-speaking Region’, <https://doi.org/10.3311/celistr.37098>.

470.4.1.1 ACTION ITEM: Chair and Secretary to include in next report to Board.

470.4.1.2 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to include in outreach section of website.

470.5 Joint RDA Board and RSC Working Group on Artificial Intelligence

470.5.1 RSC/Chair/2024/7

The RSC Chair reported that the RDA Board discussed the draft charge document (RSC/Chair/2024/7) at its last meeting and so it was now ready for discussion and approval by the RSC.

470.5.1.1 ACTION ITEM: RSC Chair, Board Chair and Secretary to prepare short communication for the Board.

470.5.1.2 ACTION ITEM: Once 470.5.1.1 has been carried out, Secretary to publish RSC/Chair/2024/7¹.

470.5.2 Working Group Meetings

Ahava Cohen (Working Group Chair) reported that the group has met as part of scoping the charge and has also sent out a scoping survey to the wider community. The next meeting will look at the responses received as well as taking the steps necessary to operationalise the finalised charge document ([RSC/Chair/2024/7](https://www.rsc.org.uk/2024/07/12/rsc-chair-2024-7/)).

471 Fast Tracks

Two Fast Track proposals were considered in this meeting. The first was approved and will be implemented as soon as is practicable. The second will come back as a full proposal at the next RSC Meeting in November.

471.1 FT2024-07 – Fast Track Proposal on Clarification of Wording on Transcribing Symbols

The Secretary presented this Fast Track following feedback submitted via the RDA Toolkit by a member of the wider community. The [Guidelines on normalized transcription](#) contain an option to “Omit or replace a symbol by another symbol or sign of punctuation that can be reproduced by available facilities”. The RSC approved the Fast Track to make the implied condition in the option explicit:

Marked-up copy only:

¹ RSC/Chair/2024/7 was [published on the RSC website](#) and [archived to ALAIR](#) on 1 August 2024.

CONDITION

A symbol cannot be transcribed using available facilities.

CONDITION OPTION

Omit or replace ~~it a symbol by~~ with another symbol or sign of punctuation that can be reproduced by available facilities.

471.1.2 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to create and implement RSC/FT2024-07/Decisions.

471.2 FT2024-08 – Revisions to Definitions of Aggregate, Aggregating Work, and Aggregates Guidance

A proposal was submitted too close to the deadline for the July meeting for constituencies to have time to review it. As it was borderline Fast Track / Full proposal, the Secretary presented it as a Fast Track, with the *caveat* that it may be better presented as a full proposal for November. After praising the work of the Technical Team Liaison Officer and the Education and Orientation Officer in preparing this update to the wording of the guidance, voting members of the RSC decided that the importance of the topic was such that it should be presented as a full proposal for constituency review and discussion at the RSC Public Session in November.

471.2.1 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to prepare RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/2 and publish it for constituency review.

472 Policies for Management of the Community Resources Section

The Director of ALA Digital Reference led a discussion on the processes for accepting contributing partners.

472.1 ACTION ITEM: Chair and Secretary to add new partners as a standing item on the agenda for Executive Group meetings.

473 Slides for Educators

The Education and Orientation Officer shared her draft. The RSC praised her work so far and encouraged her to continue in the same vein towards completion.

473.1 ACTION ITEM: Education and Orientation Officer to finalise slides.

Public Session

16 July, 9-11pm Central European Summer Time, via Zoom

The meeting opened with a warm welcome from RSC Chair Renate Behrens ([Item 469.1](#)).

474 Update on RSC/ORDAC/2024/1: [Proposal on] Dual-naming of Corporate Body and Place

In discussion at the April RSC Public Session ([RSC/Minutes/456-468](#) Item 462), it was apparent to the RSC that the issues raised by [this proposal](#) have potential implications for all Regions. A Rapid Action group consisting of the Oceania, Europe and North America Representatives, the Wider Community Engagement Officer, and the Translations Team Liaison Officer. Charlotte Christensen provided an overview of their actions to date. Jessica Grzegorski shared that examples will be included in the July release of the RDA Toolkit (fuller details included at [Item 470.2.1](#)).

474.1 ACTION ITEM: Oceania Representative to coordinate the submission of RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/rev in time for constituency review ahead of the November RSC Meeting.

474.1.1 ACTION ITEM: Rapid Action group to assist Oceania Representative with additional text about non-Roman scripts.

475 RSC/ReligionsWG/2024/1

The RSC Chair formally thanked the Working Group for their work on [this proposal](#), and their speed in responding to the RSC's written [responses](#) with [RSC/ReligionsWG/2024/1/summary/ReligionsWG](#).

475.1 Recommendations 1-3

After a wide-ranging discussion, the RSC voted to accept Recommendations 1-3 with the following amendments:

Recommendation 1

Marked-up copy only:

Ancient ~~and~~or international bodies

Examples of ancient or international bodies include religious bodies, councils, and assemblies (~~including church councils~~); fraternal and knightly orders, ~~church councils~~; and diplomatic conferences.

Recommendation 3

Removal of the word “local” in the body of the text was agreed:

Marked-up copy only:

~~Local~~ Places of worship

CONDITION

A corporate body is a religious institution that congregates at a ~~local~~ place of activity.

A value of Corporate Body: name of corporate body appears in different forms.

CONDITION OPTION

Record a value that appears most frequently in sources of information.

Example ...

CONDITION OPTION

Record a value that is chosen in this order of preference:

1. a form of name containing the name of any person, object, place, community or event to which a ~~local church, etc.~~, place of worship is dedicated or after which it is named
2. a form of name ~~beginning with~~ containing a word or phrase descriptive of a type of ~~local church, etc.~~ place of worship
3. a form of name ~~beginning with~~ containing a name of a place in which a ~~local church, etc.~~ place of worship is or has been situated.

CONDITION OPTION

Record a value that includes the name of a larger corporate body with which the place of worship is affiliated.

475.2 Recommendation 4

There was a lengthy discussion on this recommendation. Ahava Cohen had been asked by the Working Group Chair to explain the rationale behind this recommendation, which was to ensure that it was explicit that cataloguers could choose to use the name by which the group refers to itself.

While taking on board this idea, the RSC expressed two concerns that they wish the Working Group to discuss. Both concern the principle of representation that permeates

RDA. Several RSC members were concerned lest this option undermine this principle. Some other members were particularly concerned if it were possible to use this *in this one place* that it was introducing an inconsistency. Is there something about religious organisations that is different from other corporate bodies?

The Secretary was asked to go back to the Working Group Chair and ask him to ask for feedback from the Working Group's members. She did so on 17 July at 10:21 (UK time), and shared with them the example used by the Technical Team Liaison Officer in the Public Session, the Jesuits, whose publications are issued under The Society of Jesus ([Wikipedia entry for reference](#)). She also highlighted The Church of Jesus Christ of the Latter-day Saints / Mormons ([Wikipedia entry for reference](#)) and the International Society for Krishna Consciousness / Hare Krishnas ([Wikipedia for reference](#)). The Working Group Chair asked the rest of the Working Group for comments and this is currently under discussion, with the intention to report back to the RSC meeting in November, possibly with a proposal, possibly with a Discussion Paper.

475.3 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to prepare and implement RSC/ReligionsWG/2024/1/Decisions.

475.4 ACTION ITEM: Chair and Secretary to keep abreast of the Working Group's intentions for November, to ensure there is time for any constituency review required, alongside the other items that are out for constituency review ahead of the November meeting.

476 RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1

The RSC Chair thanked the Working Group for its work on [this Discussion Paper](#) and welcomed its Chair, Thomas Brenndorfer, to the meeting as an invited speaker. She explained to observers that the point of this was to introduce the paper and listen to any initial reactions from the wider community. Both Renate Behrens and Thomas Brenndorfer stressed the importance of constituency review, and encouraged observers and the wider RDA cataloguing community to contribute via their Regional Representatives or the Wider Community Engagement Officer ([contact details on the RSC website](#)).

476.1 Parallel Work at IFLA

Thomas Brenndorfer highlighted that the work undertaken by the Extent Working Group runs parallel to that of IFLA, and noted the timing of the constituency review for the [ISBD for Manifestation \(ISBDM\)](#). In response to questions from observers, the Technical Team Liaison Officer stated clearly that RDA is an implementation of the IFLA Library Reference Model (LRM). ISBDM is the first stage of an implementation of the LRM (It is assumed that ISBD for Works, Expressions and Items will follow). Therefore, there is a natural alignment between RDA and the LRM. As Chair of both the

RSC and the [IFLA ISBDM Task Force](#), Renate Behrens confirmed that ISBDM is narrower in focus (Manifestation level) and more prescriptive than RDA. It will be possible to use the ISBDM to generate an application profile for RDA, because the alignment is so close. The Technical Team Liaison Officer confirmed that this is because of the underpinning work of the LRM. In terms of the work on Extent, Thomas Brenndorfer confirmed that the Extent Working Group have been watching the development of the ISBDM and its constituency review closely. Indeed, some members of the Extent Working Group are also members of the ISBDM Task Force.

476.2 Existing String Encoding Schemes

In his walk through of the Discussion Paper, Thomas Brenndorfer highlighted that it seems sensible to redistribute the existing instructions across the new structure suggested in the Discussion Paper. RSC members and observers questioned the impact of this change on workloads for cataloguing agencies. One observer quantified this, by stating that there are 162 options in extent of manifestation and their institution and others have created Policy Statements for each of these. Even a redistribution will generate workload. Thomas Brenndorfer thanked RSC members and observers for this initial feedback. The Working Group had discussed impact, but was not in a position to make a blanket statement. One advantage of a Discussion Paper (as opposed to a proposal) is that the wider RDA cataloguing community can share their observations and experience. He would, however, add a statement on legacy data to the paper².

476.3 Schedule for Constituency Review

Thomas Brenndorfer thanked RSC members and observers for their initial observations. He committed to presenting RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1/rev/2 after the meeting. In response to a question from the RSC Secretary, he confirmed that if members of the wider RDA cataloguing community need to invest time in translating the Discussion Paper, they should translate RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1/rev/2. The one *caveat* is that if there are surprises in the report from the IFLA ISBDM constituency review (which is due over the summer), the Working Group may feel the need to issue a further revision. However, as confirmed by the RSC Chair, Extent is too important an issue to delay the presentation of the Discussion Paper until after the ISBDM review is complete. After all, IFLA is reviewing only Manifestation at the moment.

476.4 ACTION ITEM: Working Group Chair to coordinate and draft RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1/rev2.

476.5 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to publish RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1/rev2.

² RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1/rev2 highlights that Community Resources are where legacy instructions resides. Many current instructions for Extent are for string encoding schemes, and have associated policy statements that would be expected to remain attached to those legacy instructions. RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1/rev2 was [published on the RSC website](#) and [archived to ALAIR](#) on 1 August 2024.

476.6 ACTION ITEM: Regional Representatives and WCEO to circulate RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1/rev2.

477 Update from ALA Digital Reference

James Hennelly shared the work that has been undertaken since the last RSC Meeting. The July 2024 release was imminent. The technical processes for updates is taking longer because of the number of different languages in the Toolkit now. After the imminent July release, the next will be in September 2024 and then February 2025.

478 Update on Working Groups

478.1 Task and Finish Working Groups

Renate Behrens highlighted the ongoing work of the Working Groups on Religion and Extent ([see Item 470.1 for more detail](#)).

478.2 Examples Working Group

Jessica Grzegorski shared highlights of the Examples Working Group's activities ([see Item 470.2 for more detail](#)).

478.3 Technical Working Group

Damian Iseminger shared highlights of the Technical Working Group's activities ([see Item 470.3 for more detail](#)).

478.4 Translations Working Group

Szabolcs Dance shared highlights of the Translation Working Group's activities ([see Item 470.4 for more detail](#)).

479 Update from Regional Representatives and Wider Community Engagement Officer

479.1 Wider Community Engagement Officer

Renate Behrens shared an update from Charlene Chou. She could not be present for the Public Session because it is the middle of the night in Shanghai, where she is working, and in a few hours, on 17 July, she was due to present RDA updates at the Shanghai Library and invite them to support RDA implementation in China. On 31 July she is also giving a Q&A session on RDA with the core group at the National Central Library, Taipei, Taiwan. Finally, she is happy to report that the translation of RDA Reference into Chinese is progressing. Simplified script is completed. The next step may be review and feedback.

479.2 Europe Representative

Ahava Cohen gave an overview of activities in Europe. In particular, she highlighted that [presentations from the EURIG Annual Meeting are now available on the website](#).

479.3 North America Representative

Robert Maxwell took the opportunity to thank the RDA Board members who came to the ALA preconference and to those who spoke at the NARDAC Update Forum at ALA. NARDAC is continuing work drafting a proposal that they hope to present soon.

479.3.1 New NARDAC Positions

The NARDAC Committee has two new positions, a French-speaking representative and a Library Science education representative, and has welcomed Daniel Paradis and Shawne Miksa as their first incumbents. [The full list of members is available on the website.](#)

479.4 Oceania Representative

ORDAC has welcomed two new members, Bradley Chugg and Catherine Barnes. They also wanted to acknowledge the work of outgoing members Anoushka McGuire and Melissa Parent. Implementation of Official RDA is set to begin at the National Library of New Zealand in August, with further work towards implementation schedules underway elsewhere in the region.

480 Update from the Education and Orientation Officer

Elisa Sze provided a brief update on her activities since the last RSC Meeting. In particular, she shared how much she had enjoyed presenting at the Translators' Meeting at the EURIG Annual Meeting, in which she had shared her handout on [RDA Teaching & Training Tips](#). She has been working with the Technical Team Liaison Officer on the Aggregates Definitions (see [Item 471.2](#)). In September she will be presenting (remotely) on the topic of Teaching RDA at the XIII Latin American Meeting on RDA.

481 Cooperations

Renate Behrens provided an update on current activities relating to the RSC's cooperation with other international bodies. An update to the protocol with the International ISSN Centre is underway, and cooperation with the PCC and CC:DA is being extended. The RSC and Board members took part in the meetings at the ALA Conference in San Diego and agreed on concrete further steps. The existing collaboration with ABINIA, the Latin American RDA Committee, will be continued. RSC and Board members will also be attending the congress in Mexico this year in September with virtual presentations. Cooperation with the Bibframe communities will also be intensified. The RSC Chair will take part in the European congress in Helsinki in September. The aim is to establish an official protocol for cooperation.

482 AOB and Thanks from the Chair

482.1 RSC members honoured

The RSC Secretary took the opportunity to congratulate two members of the RSC on recent honours. [Robert Maxwell is the recipient of the 2024 Margaret Mann Citation](#) and

[Renate Behrens has been awarded an IFLA Scroll of Appreciation](#), one of its highest honours.

482.2 Thanks from the Chair

Renate Behrens gave thanks to the members of the RSC for their hard work and to observers for their time and interest. The next Public Session of the RSC will take place on Tuesday 12 November in Washington DC and online. Exact time to be confirmed. The RSC Secretary will send out a call for observers closer to the time.

Approved by the RDA Steering Committee
12 August 2024.