MINUTES APRIL 2024 RSC MEETING Asynchronous, via Basecamp and Zoom 15-18 April 2024

Attending: Colleen Barbus, RDA Board Chair

Renate Behrens, RSC Chair

Charlene Chou, RSC Wider Community Engagement Officer

Charlotte Christensen, RSC Oceania representative

Ahava Cohen, RSC Europe representative

Szabolcs Dancs, RSC Translations Team Liaison Officer

Jessica Grzegorski, RDA Examples Editor

James Hennelly, Director, ALA Digital Reference (RDA publisher)

Damian Iseminger, RSC Technical Team Liaison Officer Robert Maxwell, RSC North America representative Elisa Sze, RSC Education and Orientation Officer

Anne Welsh, RSC Secretary

Apologies: Szabolcs Dancs was unable to attend the Public Session on 16 April.

Observers: Jack Ennis-Butler (Backup Oceania Representative)

Observers (Public Session on 16 April only):

Sue Andrews, Canada

Thomas Brenndorfer (Chair of the Extent Working Group), Canada

Kathy Glennan, USA

Bridget Jennings, New Zealand

Ed Jones, USA

Ebe Kartus, New Zealand

Timothy Ryan Mendenhall, USA

Honor Moody, USA Olivera Nastic, Serbia

Daniel Paradis (member of the Translations Working Group), Canada

Amanda Ros, USA Anna Slawek, Canada Amanda Sprochi, USA

I-Chene Tai (member of the Examples Working Group), USA

Crystal Yragui, USA

Item numbering continues from the previous meeting.

CONTENTS

Executive Session

<u>456</u>	Welcome, catching up and review of past action items
<u>457</u>	Working Groups
458	Community Resources: suggestions from Translations Team member about naming of legacy Anglo-American instructions
<u>459</u>	Community Zones
<u>460</u>	Orientation package for new RSC members
<u>461</u>	Fast Tracks
Public Session	
<u>456</u>	Welcome
<u>462</u>	RSC/ORDAC/2024/1: [Proposal on] Dual-naming of Corporate Body and Place
463	RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1: Proposal to revise the element hierarchy for appellations of work groups
<u>464</u>	Update from ALA Digital Reference
<u>465</u>	Update on Working Groups
<u>466</u>	Update from Regional Representatives and Wider Community Engagement Officer
<u>467</u>	Update from the Education and Orientation Officer
<u>468</u>	Thanks from the Chair

Executive Session

Welcome, catching up and review of past action items

456.1 Welcome

RSC Chair Renate Behrens opened both the Executive Session on 15 April and the Public Session on 16 April by offering a warm welcome. In the Public Session, she passed on apologies from Szabolcs Dancs, the Translations Team Liaison Officer, and asked each member of the RSC to introduce themselves, then outlined the way that the meeting would be structured. For each topic, she would ask RSC members for comments first and then open to observers, from whom she warmly welcomed questions and comments.

456.2 Review of past action items

All actions from the previous meeting have been completed or are in progress.

457 Working Groups

457.1 Task and Finish Working Groups

As decided in the January RSC Meeting (RSC/Minutes/444-455) Item 446.1) the Official Languages Working Group and the Place/Jurisdiction Working Group have been discharged (RSC/Chair/2024/8; RSC/Chair/2024/9). As reported in RSC/Minutes/444-455 Item 446.2, the terms of the Extent Working Group and the Religions in RDA Working Group have been extended (RSC/Chair/2024/3; RSC/Chair/2024/4). RSC/ReligionsWG/2024/1 has been submitted and will be circulated for discussion in the Public Session of the July RSC Meeting (16 July, 9-11pm Central European Standard Time). The Extent Working Group has made progress on its Discussion Paper, and its Chair, Thomas Brenndorfer, will present an update at in the Public Session of the July RSC Meeting.

457.2 New Task and Finish Working Group

With the discharge of the Official Languages and Place/Jurisdiction Working Groups (Item 457.1), and the formation of the Joint RDA Board and RSC Working Group on Artificial Intelligence (Item 457.6), there is capacity for the RSC to form another Working Group this year. After discussion of several potential areas, it was decided to form an Archives Working Group.

ACTION ITEM: Chair and Secretary to prepare the next steps to form an Archives Working Group.

- **ACTION ITEM:** Chair and Secretary to add Archives Working Group to the agenda of the next Executive Group Meeting¹.
- **457.2.3 ACTION ITEM:** Chair and Secretary to add Archives Working Group to the agenda of the RSC Meeting in July.

457.3 Examples Working Group

The Examples Editor, Jessica Grzegorski, who is the Chair of the Examples Working Group, provided a brief update on activities since the last RSC Meeting in January. This has included testing and refining a Google form for Working Group members to submit examples, as part of a workflow for submitting, reviewing and approving examples for inclusion in the RDA Toolkit. Work is focused on creating examples for elements that have none.

Other actions by the Examples Editor include attending the experts' review of ISBD for Manifestation alongside the Technical Team Liaison Officer and the Translations Team Liaison Officer; making a brief presentation about the work of the Examples Working Group to a meeting of the Translations Working Group and engaging in discussion about how the translators are working with examples in RDA translations; recording an orientation video on the role of the RDA Examples Editor; answering several questions about RDA examples at the first of several PCC Introductory RDA Training webinars which she was attending as an observer.

457.4 Technical Working Group

The Technical Team Liaison Officer, Damian Iseminger, who is the Chair of the Technical Working Group, gave a brief update on activities since the last RSC Meeting in January. Of particular note is the recruitment of two new members, Christopher Holden (USA) and Stefan Schuh (Austria). The RSC extended a warm welcome to them both, and ratified RSC/Chair/2024/11, which supersedes RSC/Chair/2024/5 as the charge document for the Working Group.

457.5 Translations Working Group

The Translations Team Liaison Officer, Szabolcs Dancs, who is the Chair of the Translations Working Group, provided a brief update on activities since the last RSC Meeting in January. Meetings organised include introducing Jessica Grzegorski as Chair of the Examples Working Group, and the upcoming RDA translators meeting as part of the EURIG meeting in Helsinki (16 May). The RSC extended a warm welcome to Ben Gu (China), responsible for the Simplified Chinese translation; Anneke Houtkamp (Netherlands), responsible for the Dutch partial translation; Isabelle Niu (Taiwan),

¹ Because there is so much overlap between the Development Team and Admin Team meetings, their Chairs, James Hennelly and Renate Behrens, decided to hold both meetings together, the combined meeting to be called the Executive Group Meeting.

responsible for the Traditional Chinese translation; and Martha Romero Ramírez (Mexico), responsible for the Spanish translation. It ratified <u>RSC/Chair/2024/12</u>, which supersedes <u>RSC/Chair/2024/6</u> as the charge document for the Working Group.

457.6 Joint RDA Board and RSC Working Group on Artificial Intelligence

Renate Behrens reported that the establishment of this Working Group was confirmed at the RDA Board Meeting in March and its membership confirmed (Christian Aliverti (RDA Board); Colleen Barbus (RDA Board Chair); Renate Behrens (RSC Chair); Judith Cannan (RDA Board); Ahava Cohen (RSC); Charlene Chou (RSC). An initial meeting is planned and an online workspace has been set up for the Working Group. Members of the RSC discussed some of the topics the Working Group will consider.

458 Community Resources: suggestions from Translations Team member about naming of legacy Anglo-American instructions

Daniel Paradis, a member of the Translations Working Group, had sent an email to the RSC Chair, Secretary, and Translations Team Leader with suggestions regarding the terminology used in the Community Resources pages of the Toolkit. After discussion, the RSC suggested to the publisher that the section currently called "Community refinements" should be renamed "RDA legacy refinements" and the section currently called "Community vocabularies" should be renamed "RDA legacy vocabularies".

458.1 ACTION ITEM: James Hennelly to respond to suggestion.

458.1.1 ACTION ITEM: If 458.1 is in the affirmative. James Hennelly to implement changes:

FROM "Community refinements" TO "RDA legacy refinements" FROM "Community vocabularies" TO "RDA legacy vocabularies".

458.2 The RSC expressed its thanks to Daniel Paradis for raising this issue.

459 Community Zones

There was some discussion around the terminology for the Community Resources section of the Toolkit, and the introduction of the informal "Community Zones" by some members of the RDA cataloguing community (presumably as a result of "Community Zones" being terminology used by a major Library Management System provider. As publisher, James Hennelly suggested that the RSC should be careful to stick to the use of "Community Resources" and referred us to Item 464 for an update on recent developments.

460 Orientation package for new RSC members

Development is ongoing.

461 Fast Tracks

Three Fast Track proposals were considered in this meeting. All three were approved and will be implemented as soon as is practicable,

461.1 FT2024-04 – Fast Track Proposal on "content from type or plates"

At the January 2024 Meeting of the RSC, FT2024-01 – Definition for "printer agent of", etc. was discussed (RSC/Minutes/444-455 Item 448/1). Discussion was wide-ranging, beyond the scope of the proposal itself, and as well as the questions in the Fast Track itself, the Secretary asked whether the RSC would like a further Fast Track to be prepared for the other issue they had raised, which was concerned with the use of the phrase "content from type or plates". The RSC voted unanimously in favour of such a Fast Track, and an ACTION ITEM was placed on the Secretary to prepare FT2024-04 on this topic (RSC/Minutes/444-455 Item 448.1.3). In the discussion of FT2024-04, the Technical Team Liaison Officer suggested wording that the RSC tacitly approved. The Secretary then asked five questions based on this wording, which voting members of the RSC approved.

- **461.1.1 ACTION ITEM:** Secretary to prepare RSC/FT2024-04/Decisions **461.1.2 ACTION ITEM:** Technical Team Liaison Officer to implement
 - RSC/FT2024-04/Decisions in the Registry and Glossary.

461.2 FT2024-05 – Fast Track Proposal for revising Data Provenance guidance

The acceptance of the Collections Model in RDA has led to a slight revision in the categorization of *metadata works*. As a result of the changes, the Technical Working Group proposed new wording for the guidance for <u>Data Provenance</u>, to replace the first 8 paragraphs of the text. The RSC discussed the proposed changes and voted unanimously to implement the new wording.

461.2.1 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to prepare and implement RSC/FT2024-05/Decisions

461.3 FT2024-06 – Fast Track Proposal to add Region PAL to the RDA Regional Encoding Vocabulary

Colleagues in the Europe Region reported that the <u>RDA Regional Encoding Vocabulary</u> does not have a term that describes the regional lockout for video games that covers those regions of the globe that use the PAL video format for colour analog video signals. The Technical Team Liaison Officer submitted this Fast Track proposing the inclusion of Region PAL in the RDA Regional Encoding Vocabulary. The RSC voted unanimously to approve this recommendation.

- **461.3.1 ACTION ITEM:** Secretary to prepare RSC/FT2024/06/Decisions
- **ACTION ITEM:** Technical Team Liaison Officer to implement RSC/FT2024-06.

Public Session

16 April, 9-11pm Central European Summer Time, via Zoom

The meeting opened with a warm welcome from RSC Chair Renate Behrens (Item 456.1)

Charlotte Christensen provided an overview of the proposal (RSC/ORDAC/2024/1), highlighting that the core of the issue is knowing that sometimes what you see is one name and sometimes it is two. Verbal summaries of their responses were provided by Robert Maxwell (RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/NARDAC), Ahava Cohen (RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/EURIG) and Damian Iseminger (RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/TTWG). Elisa Sze stated that RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/summary/ORDAC had addressed the issues she had raised (RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/EOO) and she believes that a separate option is justified. Ahava Cohen observed that it appears that Oceania and Europe are taking two different approaches, with Oceania working through each option presented and Europe only considering options if they seem relevant. Other members of the RSC maintained the positions stated in their formal responses (summarised in RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/summary)

- RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/Examples Editor
- RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/TranslationsTLO
- RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/WCEO

462.1 RDA's open road assumption

In the course of the discussion, the Technical Team Liaison Officer made the important point that RDA has always worked on an open road assumption -i.e. if RDA says nothing on a topic it does not mean that topic is not important, simply that RDA has had nothing to say on that topic.

462.2 Examples

In the Public Session, the Examples Editor reiterated her observation in RSC/ORDAC/2024/1/Examples Editor that the proposal and its response have highlighted the need for examples on this topic. In further discussion after the Public Session, the RSC decided that it would be appropriate to add examples.

ACTION ITEM: Examples Editor and Examples Working Group to add examples covering the issue raised by ORDAC in the proposal.

462.3 Further discussion

After wide-ranging discussion in the Public Session and, following it, throughout the rest

of the April Meeting, the RSC agreed that the issues raised by ORDAC would benefit from further attention. As well as examples (<u>Item 462.2</u>), a task and finish working group was suggested. Charlotte Christensen agreed that "continuing the discussion is definitely better than forcing a quick decision" and expressed "thanks to those who are willing to help with this."

- **ACTION ITEM:** Chair and Secretary to add to agenda for Executive Meeting on 15 May.
- **462.3.2 ACTION ITEM:** Following discussion at the Executive Meeting (<u>Item</u> <u>462.3.1</u>), Chair to constitute group for further discussion ahead of July meeting.

463 RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1: Proposal to revise the element hierarchy for appellations of work groups

Damian Iseminger introduced <u>RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1/rev</u>, highlighting that the proposal is declaring an explicit relationship already declared in their inverse elements – in other words, it is making explicit something that was implicit before. The formal responses to the proposal (<u>RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1/rev/summary</u>) were all positive, and can be read in their entirety on ALAIR:

- RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1/rev/EOO
- RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1/rev/EURIG
- RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1/rev/Examples Editor
- RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1/rev/NARDAC
- RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1/rev/ORDAC
- RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1/rev/TranslationsTLO
- RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1/rev/WCEO

463.1 "Entailment"

In his introduction to the proposal, Damian Iseminger used the term "entailment" several times. Robert Maxwell asked for a definition for the benefit of those less familiar with Linked Data terminology. Damian Iseminger referred to the definition in RDF:

In brief, an RDF expression A is said to *entail* another RDF expression B if every possible arrangement of things in the world that makes A true also makes B true. On this basis, if the truth of A is presumed or demonstrated then the truth of B can be inferred. (*Resource Description Framework (RDF): Concepts and Abstract Syntax. W3C Recommendation 10 February 2024. 3. RDF Concepts. 3.6 Entailment*, https://www.w3.org/TR/2004/REC-rdf-concepts-20040210/#section-Entailment).

Robert Maxwell asked if this was, then, another way of saying properties are inherited, and Damian Iseminger confirmed that in both RDA and the IFLA LRM, we do talk about properties being *inherited* and that the proposal was an update based on the principles set out in RDA when it says, "All elements that can be inherited from an entity

hierarchy are explicitly identified and defined in RDA" (*RDA Registry. Guide for Developers. RDA Elements*, https://www.rdaregistry.info/rgGuide/). The proposal is declaring an explicit relationship already declared in their inverse elements.

463.2 Further discussion

Having received tacit approval from the RSC members present at the Public Session, <u>RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1/rev</u> was formally approved by a unanimous vote by *all* voting members in the asynchronous Executive Session.

- **ACTION ITEM:** Secretary to prepare and publish RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1/Decisions.
- **ACTION ITEM:** Technical Team Liaison Officer to implement RSC/TechnicalWG/2024/1/Decisions

464 Update from ALA Digital Reference

464.1 March Release of the RDA Toolkit

James Hennelly shared the highlights of the update to the RDA Toolkit in March, including the introduction of the new Community Resources space, and the addition of the Orientation version of the Guidance menu in French and Finnish languages. An overview of the changes is available on the RDA Toolkit Blog (https://www.rdatoolkit.org/news/rda/march-2024-rda-toolkit-release) and Toolkit subscribers can access the *Notes on the March 21, 2024 RDA Toolkit Release* in the Revision History section of the Toolkit (https://access.rdatoolkit.org/Resource/Index?externalId=en-US topic 03222024 RN).

464.2 Policies for Managing the Community Resources Section

James Hennelly requested that the RSC have further discussions about policies for managing Community Resources.

ACTION ITEM: Chair and Secretary to add to agenda of July RSC Meeting.

464.3 Release Schedule 2025

The increase in languages and scripts has resulted in a lengthier process for each Release of the Toolkit. James Hennelly explained that from 2025 the Release Schedule will timetable 3 releases, each with staged release in different languages. As part of this change, ALA Digital Resources will be adding a new server.

464.4 New Websites for RDA Toolkit, RDA Board, RSC, and Regional Groups

James Hennelly also reported the upgrade of the Drupal websites. Moving forward, all will be united under https://www.rdatoolkit.org, with sections for:

• RDA Board: https://www.rdatoolkit.org/rdaboard

- RDA Steering Committee: https://www.rdatoolkit.org/rsc
- RDA Regions: https://www.rdatoolkit.org/regions, including
 - o Europe (EURIG): https://www.rdatoolkit.org/europe
 - o North America (NARDAC): https://www.rdatoolkit.org/northamerica
 - Oceania (ORDAC): https://www.rdatoolkit.org/oceania

Automatic redirects will be in place, but it is expected that ALA Digital Reference, the RSC Secretary, and those responsible for the websites in the Regions repair any broken links.

- **RSC members and other interested people:** Update any browser shortcuts to the new web addresses.
- **Members of the RDA cataloguing community:** Report any broken links directly to James Hennelly. His contact details are on the RSC members page (https://www.rdatoolkit.org/rsc/rsc-members).
- **464.4.3 RSC Secretary:** Proofread RSC pages and repair any broken links.

464.5 RDA Webinars

James Hennelly reported that he would present a webinar on Community Resources on 14 May (https://www.rdatoolkit.org/CR_webinar). It will be shared on the RDA YouTube channel (https://www.youtube.com/@RDAToolkitVideo) as soon as possible afterwards. He highlighted recent webinars that are already available on the Toolkit YouTube channel:

- 'Making RDA Work for You: Leveraging the Semantic Coherency of the RDA Element Set' by Damian Iseminger, 26 February 2024, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=29GNR2Nclb0
- 'NARDAC Spring Update Forum', 8 April 2024, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AXc2bbH W7E

465 Update on Working Groups

465.1 Task and Finish Working Groups

Renate Behrens highlighted the ongoing work of the Working Groups on Religion and Extent (see Item 457.1).

465.1.1 Timescale for discussion

One of the observers asked about the length of time that would be given to constituencies to discuss the upcoming discussion paper on Extent. Renate Behrens gave reassurance that plenty of time would be given to allow for discussion.

465.2 Examples Working Group

Jessica Grzegorski shared highlights of the Examples Working Group's activities (see Item 457.3). Renate Behrens offered thanks to Jessica, the former Examples Editor, Honor Moody, and the Working Group for their hard work.

465.3 Technical Working Group

Damian Iseminger shared highlights of the Technical Working Group's activities (see Item 457.4). If observers or members of the wider RDA cataloguing community are interested in volunteering for the Technical Working Group, please contact Damian Iseminger in the first instance. It's a good opportunity to think in a technical way about RDA and the future of cataloguing. His contact details are on the RSC members page (https://www.rdatoolkit.org/rsc/rsc-members). Renate Behrens offered thanks to Damian and the rest of the Technical Working Group for their hard work.

465.4 Translations Working Group

Renate Behrens shared an update from Szabolcs Dancs, who was unable to attend in person (see Item 457.5). Renate offered thanks to Szabolcs and the rest of the Translations Working Group for their hard work.

466 Update from Regional Representatives and Wider Community Engagement Officer

466.1 North America Representative

Robert Maxwell provided an update from NARDAC, beginning with the news that there is likely to be an expansion of the NARDAC Committee. The current complement consists of 2 American Library Association (ALA) representatives, 2 Library of Congress (LC) representatives, and 2 Canadian Cataloguing Committee (CCC) representatives. Discussions are underway to add to this 1 French language representative and 1 Cataloging Educators representative. NARDAC's current activities include the preparation of a proposal about an apparent inconsistency in transcription elements. Robert Maxwell also commended the LC PCC's Introductory RDA Training courses, highlighting that you don't have to be in North America to attend. Full details and recordings: https://www.loc.gov/catworkshop/rda/PCC-Introductory-RDA-Training-Webinars/index.html.

Recording of NARDAC Forum. In response to a query from an observer about the recording of the NARDAC Spring Forum, James Hennelly replied that he was sharing it on the RDA Toolkit YouTube channel (see Item 464.5).

466.2 Oceania Representative

Charlotte Christensen shared that work on their proposal (Item 462) had occupied most of ORDAC's time since the last RSC Meeting. In the Region, many are waiting for National Library of New Zealand documentation. The consultation on Indigenous views on Place and Agent as they pertain to resource description is expected to be a lengthy process.

466.3 Europe Representative

Ahava Cohen took the opportunity to thank Renate Behrens (RSC Chair) and Szabolcs Dancs (who as well as being Translations Team Leader is also Backup Europe Representation) for their support while she is not able to travel due to the ongoing War in Israel. Renate Behrens reassured her that they were happy to do all they can to help, although, of course, she continues to hope that the War will end soon. She thanked Ahava for her diligence in her work as Europe Representative. At the moment, EURIG is focusing on the upcoming meeting in Helsinki (https://www.rdatoolkit.org/rsc/eurig-annual-meeting-15-16th-may-2024). Ahava Cohen also reported that across the Region there are various projects on the use of RDA as a vocabulary.

466.4 Wider Community Education Officer

Charlene Chou provided an overview of her ongoing activities. Her upcoming visit to NYU Shanghai as NYU Global Research Fellow is providing many opportunities to meet Asian colleagues face-to-face. She has also initiated discussions with the RDA Board member for the Region, Haliza Jailani. If any observers or members of the wider RDA cataloguing community are aware of libraries in East Asia who are interested in learning more about RDA, Charlene encouraged them to please be in touch. Her contact details are on the RSC members page (https://www.rdatoolkit.org/rsc/rsc-members).

467 Update from the Education and Orientation Officer

Elisa Sze shared the link for her handout for LIS educators (https://www.rdatoolkit.org/news/rda/rda-handout-educators-and-trainers | http://hdl.handle.net/11213/21493) and talked through it. She has already taken part in some events at which she has been able to promote the handout and talk about it, including the NARDAC Forum (recording available – see Item 464.5). Upcoming events include the EURIG Annual Meeting (https://www.rdatoolkit.org/rsc/eurig-annual-meeting-15-16th-may-2024). She will be attending the ALA Annual Meeting in person and will be happy to meet up with members of the RDA cataloguing community there – do just reach out. Her contact details are on the RSC members page (https://www.rdatoolkit.org/rsc/rsc-members).

467.1 Unbranded template for educators

In the asynchronous Executive Session of the meeting, Elisa Sze shared the first draft of some unbranded slides she is preparing for educators to use in their own training. She asked for feedback and suggestions for development. This project is in its very early stages, and Elisa will report on it in later RSC meetings.

- **ACTION ITEM:** Education and Orientation Officer to continue to develop these slides.
- **ACTION ITEM:** Chair and Secretary to add to agenda of RSC July meeting.

468 Thanks from the Chair

Renate Behrens gave thanks to the members of the RSC for their hard work and to observers for their time and interest. The next Public Session of the RSC will take place on 16 July 2024, 9-11pm Central European Summer Time (CEST) (as announced at https://www.rdatoolkit.org/news/rsc/call-host-institution-rsc-meeting-november-2024). There is a handy time converter at https://www.timeanddate.com/worldclock/meeting.html where you can work out the time in your own time zone.

468.1 ACTION ITEM:

Secretary to post call for observers closer to July.

Approved by the RDA Steering Committee 30 May 2024.