To:        Renate Behrens, Chair, RDA Steering Committee
CC:        Anne Welsh, RSC Secretary
From:     Charlene Chou, WCEO
Subject:   Formal response to RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1/rev2 –
Discussion Paper on the Development of Extent Elements in
RDA

## General comments

I would like to thank the Extent Working Group for their thorough review and holistic approach in developing extent elements in RDA. The format of the discussion paper has provided us with many points to consider before drafting a revised proposal. I support this discussion paper in principle and agree with its overall direction. However, I have some concerns regarding the impact statements on catalogers and users mentioned on page 7. During some of my outreach meetings, catalogers expressed concerns about highly granular data or instructions, as different communities use their own cataloging guidelines for specific types of resources. For instance, the Japanese and Chinese communities have developed their own rare book cataloging guidelines due to differences in style and history. Furthermore, some catalogers have favored Getty's AAT over other vocabularies because it is more international and includes culture-specific resources, such as scrolls and rubbings.

Lastly, most of the library acquisitions budget is spent on e-resources, and an emerging trend in scholarly publishing is the curation of research datasets in data repositories. Meanwhile, we are transitioning to linked data in the production environment in

the coming years. I anticipate these topics will arise in my future outreach events.

1.1. RECOMMENDATION. Convert Manifestation: extent of manifestation to a superelement. Many current instructions will become string encoding schemes in Community Resources and other instructions will be moved to new subelements of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

I support this in part, but clarification on the updated definition is needed.

2.1. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: extent of unitary structure as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

I support.

2.2. RECOMMENDATION. Create a new RDA Extent of Unitary value vocabulary Structure which includes appropriate terms moved from RDA Carrier Extent Unit.

I support.

3.1. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: extent of unit as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

I support.

3.2. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: numbering of recording tracks as an element subtype of Manifestation: extent of unit. Move the instructions for Manifestation: tape configuration to this element.

I support this in part, but clarification on its definition is needed.

3.3. RECOMMENDATION. Move Manifestation: bibliographic format to become an element subtype of Manifestation: extent of unit.

I support.

3.4. RECOMMENDATION. Move Manifestation: dimensions to become an element subtype of Manifestation: extent of unit. Update the instructions to reflect the focus on structured descriptions for two to three dimensions.

I support this in part, but clarification on the rationale for this change is needed.

4.1. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: extent of embodied content as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

I support.

4.2. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: dimensions of embodied content as a subtype of Manifestation: extent of embodied content.

I support.

4.3. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: designation of sound channels as a subtype of Manifestation: extent of embodied content. This partly replaces Manifestation: configuration of playback channels.

I support.

4.4. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: number of sound channels as a subtype of Manifestation: extent of embodied content. This partly replaces Manifestation: configuration of playback channels.

I support.

4.5. RECOMMENDATION. Replace Manifestation: configuration of playback channels with Manifestation: designation of sound channels and Manifestation: number of sound channels. 4.6. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: reduction ratio as a subtype of Manifestation: extent of embodied content.

I support.

4.6. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: reduction ratio as a subtype of Manifestation: extent of embodied content.

I support this in part and agree with TWG's question.

4.7. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: image resolution as a subtype of Manifestation: extent of embodied content.

I support this in part and agree with TWG's question.

4.8. RECOMMENDATION WITH OPTIONS. Create an RDA Layout of Embodied Content value vocabulary. Alternatively, expand the RDA Layout value vocabulary to include terms that could be used in Manifestation: extent of embodied content.

I support.

4.9. RECOMMENDATION. Add the terms column, frame, and page to a value vocabulary for layout of embodied content.

I support.

5.1. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: extent of aggregated content as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

I support this in part, but further discussion is needed.

5.2. RECOMMENDATION WITH OPTIONS. Create a value vocabulary for RDA Extent of Aggregated Content, which will include applicable terms moved from RDA Carrier Extent Unit and RDA Format of Notated Music. Alternatively, expand the RDA Content Type value vocabulary to include terms that could be used in Manifestation: extent of embodied content.

I support this in general, but further discussion is needed.

6.1. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: number of containers as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

I support.

6.2. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: dimensions of containers as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

I support.

6.3. RECOMMENDATION. Add Manifestation: extent of storage space as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of

manifestation. This element will only be used for collection manifestations.

I support.

6.4. RECOMMENDATION. Create an RDA Container Type value vocabulary for case, portfolio, and other terms commonly used for containers.

I support.

7.1. RECOMMENDATION. Add a new manifestation statement element: Manifestation: manifestation extent statement.

I support.

7.2. RECOMMENDATION. Add a new manifestation statement element: Manifestation: manifestation numbering of extent statement.

I support.

7.3. RECOMMENDATION: Add a new set of RDA transcription guidelines "Guidelines on transcription of numbering of extent." The guidelines will be derived from the current instructions in Manifestation: extent of manifestation related to transcribing the numbering of sequences of pages, leaves, etc.

I support.

8.1. RECOMMENDATION. Review instructions and examples that may need to be added to Manifestation: note on

manifestation after reworking the other extent of manifestation elements.

I support.

9.1. RECOMMENDATION. Update the definition of Expression: extent of expression to parallel the definition of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

I support.

10.1. RECOMMENDATION. Update the definition of Work: extent of representative expression.

I support.

11.1. RECOMMENDATION. No change to Expression: duration is recommended.

I support this in part, but further discussion is needed.

12.1. RECOMMENDATION. No change to Work: duration of representative expression is recommended.

I support.

13.1. RECOMMENDATION. Remove atlas from the value vocabularies for extent in RDA.

I support.

13.2.1. RECOMMENDATION. No change to the definition of sheet is recommended.

I support.

13.2.2. RECOMMENDATION. Update the definition of folded sheet and move the term to the new RDA Extent of Unitary Structure value vocabulary.

I support.

13.2.3. RECOMMENDATION. No change to the definition of gathering is recommended.

I support.

13.2.4. RECOMMENDATION. Update the definition of leaf and remove the term from value vocabularies in RDA for carrier extent units. The term leaf will remain as a glossary term and used as a value for Manifestation: extent of unit.

I support.

13.2.5. RECOMMENDATION. No change to the definition of double leaf is recommended.

I support.

13.2.6 RECOMMENDATION. Add folded leaf to the glossary, treating the term like a folded sheet, but bound in a volume.

I support.

13.2.7. RECOMMENDATION. Update the definition of updating loose-leaf.

I support.

13.2.8. RECOMMENDATION. Add panel to the glossary, treating the term similar to leaf as a unit of extent derived from a sheet that has been folded.

I support.

13.2.9. RECOMMENDATION. No change to the definition of plate is recommended.

I support.

13.2.10. RECOMMENDATION. Move the term page to a value vocabulary for layout of embodied content and update the definition.

I support.

13.2.11. RECOMMENDATION. Move the term column to a value vocabulary for layout of embodied content and update the definition.

I support.

13.3. RECOMMENDATION. Add the new term photographic print to the Extent of Unitary Structure value vocabulary and add the term photograph to the Extent of Aggregated Content value vocabulary. The use of the term photograph in Illustrative Content will require a future decision for that value vocabulary for the kinds of expressions embodied in augmentation aggregates.

I support.

14.1. RECOMMENDATION. Remove RDA Carrier Extent Unit value vocabulary from the Toolkit after decisions are made for each current term.

I support.

14.2. RECOMMENDATION. Review RDA Format of Notated Music value vocabulary from the Toolkit after decisions are made for each existing term. Terms linked to other extent vocabularies will include a scope note for manifestations embodying notated music.

I support.