

To: Renate Behrens, Chair, RDA Steering Committee

CC: Anne Welsh, Secretary, RDA Steering Committee

From: Jessica Grzegorski, RDA Examples Editor

Subject: Formal response to RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1/rev2, Discussion paper on the development of extent elements in RDA

The RDA Examples Editor thanks the Extent Working Group for the extraordinary level of care and thoroughness that the group members took in crafting this discussion paper. Reorganizing **Manifestation: extent of manifestation** as a superelement with subelements would make extent data both readable by humans and easier for machines to process. The recommendations also create a clear and welcome distinction between carrier and content properties.

### 1. **Manifestation: extent of manifestation**

*Recommendation 1.1:* Convert **Manifestation: extent of manifestation** to a superelement. Many current instructions will become string encoding schemes in Community Resources and other instructions will be moved to new subelements of **Manifestation: extent of manifestation**.

Approve.

### 2. **Manifestation: extent of unitary structure**

*Recommendation 2.1:* Add **Manifestation: extent of unitary structure** as a subelement of **Manifestation: extent of manifestation**.

Approve.

*Recommendation 2.2:* Create a new RDA Extent of Unitary Structure value vocabulary which includes appropriate terms moved from RDA Carrier Extent Unit.

Approve.

### 3. **Manifestation: extent of unit**

**Recommendation 3.1:** Add **Manifestation: extent of unit** as a subelement of **Manifestation: extent of manifestation**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 3.2:** Add **Manifestation: numbering of recording tracks** as an element subtype of **Manifestation: extent of unit**. Move the instructions for **Manifestation: tape configuration** to this element.

Approve.

**Recommendation 3.3:** Move **Manifestation: bibliographic format** to become an element subtype of **Manifestation: extent of unit**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 3.4:** Move **Manifestation: dimensions** to become an element subtype of **Manifestation: extent of unit**. Update the instructions to reflect the focus on structured descriptions for two to three dimensions.

This recommendation warrants further discussion or clarification. Bifurcating instructions for physical measurements (i.e., most single dimensions covered by **Manifestation: extent of unit**, while other dimensions covered by **Manifestation: dimensions**) could lead to unnecessary confusion. Are there reasons why single dimensions could not be covered by the newly defined **Manifestation: dimensions**?

#### **4. Manifestation: extent of embodied content**

In addition to approving the recommendations for this subelement, I also agree with the Working Group that **Expression: duration** must be reexamined if **Manifestation: extent of embodied content** is added. Adding a manifestation-level element to RDA that is similar to the ISBDM element **playing time** is a viable option.

**Recommendation 4.1:** Add **Manifestation: extent of embodied content** as a subelement of **Manifestation: extent of manifestation**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 4.2:** Add **Manifestation: dimensions of embodied content** as a subtype of **Manifestation: extent of embodied content**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 4.3:** Add **Manifestation: designation of sound channels** as a subtype of **Manifestation: extent of embodied content**. This partly replaces **Manifestation: configuration of playback channels**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 4.4:** Add **Manifestation: number of sound channels** as a subtype of **Manifestation: extent of embodied content**. This partly replaces **Manifestation: configuration of playback channels**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 4.5:** Replace **Manifestation: configuration of playback channels** with **Manifestation: designation of sound channels** and **Manifestation: number of sound channels**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 4.6:** Add **Manifestation: reduction ratio** as a subtype of **Manifestation: extent of embodied content**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 4.7:** Add **Manifestation: image resolution** as a subtype of **Manifestation: extent of embodied content**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 4.8:** Create an RDA Layout of Embodied Content value vocabulary. Alternatively, expand the RDA Layout value vocabulary to include terms that could be used in **Manifestation: extent of embodied content**.

Approve, with preference for creating a new value vocabulary for RDA Layout of Embodied Content.

**Recommendation 4.9:** Add the terms *column*, *frame*, and *page* to a value vocabulary for layout of embodied content.

Approve.

## 5. Manifestation: extent of aggregated content

This section would benefit from additional examples that demonstrate use cases for the new element.

**Recommendation 5.1:** Add **Manifestation: extent of aggregated content** as a subelement of **Manifestation: extent of manifestation**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 5.2:** Create a value vocabulary for RDA Extent of Aggregated Content, which will include applicable terms moved from RDA Carrier Extent Unit and RDA Format of Notated Music. Alternatively, expand the RDA Content Type value vocabulary to include terms that could be used in **Manifestation: extent of embodied content**.

Approve of the creation of a new value vocabulary for RDA Extent of Aggregated Content. Specialist communities, especially those working with music and graphics, should be consulted regarding appropriate terms and definitions.

## 6. Containers

**Recommendation 6.1:** Add **Manifestation: number of containers** as a subelement of **Manifestation: extent of manifestation**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 6.2:** Add **Manifestation: dimensions of containers** as a subelement of **Manifestation: extent of manifestation**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 6.3:** Add **Manifestation: extent of storage space** as a subelement of **Manifestation: extent of manifestation**. This element will only be used for collection manifestations.

Approve.

**Recommendation 6.4:** Create an RDA Container Type value vocabulary for case, portfolio, and other terms commonly used for containers.

Approve.

## 7. Manifestation statements for extent

**Recommendation 7.1:** Add a new manifestation statement element: **Manifestation: manifestation extent statement**.

Approve.

**Recommendation 7.2:** Add a new manifestation statement element: **Manifestation: manifestation numbering of extent statement**.

I am concerned that this element blends numbering as it presents itself on the manifestation with supplied information (e.g., recording numbering and supplying the term *pages*). An easier method for recording numbering in this way may be through condition options in **Manifestation: extent of embodied content** that reference particular transcription guidelines.

**Recommendation 7.3:** Add a new set of RDA transcription guidelines “Guidelines on transcription of numbering of extent.” The guidelines will be derived from the current instructions in **Manifestation: extent of manifestation** related to transcribing the numbering of sequences of pages, leaves, etc.

Approve in principle, but with reservations. RDA transcription guidelines currently apply to all “[unstructured descriptions of manifestation elements and elements of other RDA entities where the option to use transcription guidelines is specified](#).” It seems unusual to create separate transcription guidelines for one element. Could the existing guidelines on [Numbering](#) be expanded to accommodate the numbering scenarios mentioned in the discussion paper?

## 8. Manifestation: note on manifestation

**Recommendation 8.1:** Review instructions and examples that may need to be added to **Manifestation: note on manifestation** after reworking the other extent of manifestation elements.

Approve.

## 9. Expression: extent of expression

**Recommendation 9.1:** Update the definition of **Expression: extent of expression** to parallel the definition of **Manifestation: extent of manifestation**.

Approve. Consider adding a scope note that provides common quantifiable aspects covered by this element.

## 10. Work: extent of representative expression

**Recommendation 10.1:** Update the definition of **Work: extent of representative expression**.

Approve. Consider adding a scope note that provides common quantifiable aspects covered by this element.

## 11. Expression: duration

**Recommendation 11.1:** No change to **Expression: duration** is recommended.

Approve.

## 12. Work: duration of representative expression

**Recommendation 12.1:** No change to **Work: duration of representative expression** is recommended.

Approve.

## 13. Other issues

### 13.1 Atlas

**Recommendation 13.1:** Remove *atlas* from the value vocabularies for extent in RDA.

Approve.

### **13.2. Vocabulary terms related to sheets and leaves**

***Recommendation 13.2.1:*** No change to the definition of sheet is recommended.

Approve.

***Recommendation 13.2.2:*** Update the definition of folded sheet and move the term to the new RDA Extent of Unitary Structure value vocabulary.

Approve.

***Recommendation 13.2.3:*** No change to the definition of gathering is recommended.

Approve.

***Recommendation 13.2.4:*** Update the definition of leaf and remove the term from value vocabularies in RDA for carrier extent units. The term *leaf* will remain as a glossary term and used as a value for **Manifestation: extent of unit**.

Approve.

***Recommendation 13.2.5:*** No change to the definition of double leaf is recommended.

Approve.

***Recommendation 13.2.6:*** Add *folded leaf* to the glossary, treating the term like a folded sheet, but bound in a volume.

Approve.

***Recommendation 13.2.7:*** Update the definition of updating loose-leaf.

Approve.

***Recommendation 13.2.8:*** Add *panel* to the glossary, treating the term similar to leaf as a unit of extent derived from a sheet that has been folded.

Approve.

**Recommendation 13.2.9:** No change to the definition of plate is recommended.

Approve.

**Recommendation 13.2.10:** Move the term *page* to a value vocabulary for layout of embodied content and update the definition.

Approve.

**Recommendation 13.2.11:** Move the term *column* to a value vocabulary for layout of embodied content and update the definition.

Approve.

### **13.3. Photographic print vs. photograph**

**Recommendation 13.3:** Add the new term *photographic print* to the Extent of Unitary Structure value vocabulary and add the term *photograph* to the Extent of Aggregated Content value vocabulary. The use of the term *photograph* in Illustrative Content will require a future decision for that value vocabulary for the kinds of expressions embodied in augmentation aggregates.

This will require input from specialist communities working with art and graphics. The term *photographic print* excludes photographic negatives. Either the broader term *photograph* should be retained with a revised definition covering both prints and negatives, or a term covering negatives should be added to the vocabulary.

The current and proposed definitions are also not entirely correct. Photographs are often made with a lens and camera, but not always; the only requirement is the use of light- or radiation-sensitive materials. Photograms are a good example of photographic prints made without a lens. Some “alternative process” photographic prints, such as cyanotypes and brownprints, may also be photograms made without a lens.

### **14. Reorganization of current RDA value vocabularies**

**Recommendation 14.1:** Remove RDA Carrier Extent Unit value vocabulary from the Toolkit after decisions are made for each current term.



Approve.

***Recommendation 14.2:*** Review RDA Format of Notated Music value vocabulary from the Toolkit after decisions are made for each existing term. Terms linked to other extent vocabularies will include a scope note for manifestations embodying notated music.

Approve, with the caveat that the international music cataloging community should be consulted as part of the review process.