

To: Renate Behrens, Chair, RDA Steering Committee
CC: Anne Welsh, RSC Secretary
From: Ahava Cohen, Europe representative
Subject: Formal response to RSC/ExtentWG/2024/1/rev2 – Discussion paper on the development of extent elements in RDA

EURIG acknowledges the vast amount of work the Extent Working has put into this discussion paper and thanks them for the long lead time, allowing non-Anglophone communities ample time to read and respond. We were pleased to see the extensive use of examples, which made understanding this dense document somewhat easier. That being said, there are some issues with the paper (noted below) which if adopted by the RSC and not carefully integrated into the Toolkit may lead to problems for non-Anglophone (particularly non-Western) communities.

We thank the WG for onboarding EURIG concerns about the impact on policy writers and hope that ALA and the Toolkit developers will be able to assist in the technical work of relocating policies should the recommendations below be accepted. Additionally, it should be noted that the absence of option changes makes it difficult to assess how much remedial work will be required to make policy statement alignments.

In reading the discussion paper it is clear that a working knowledge of the changes ISBD for Manifestation has undergone is essential. This is a concern in the short term, but over the life span of these changes it can be assumed that the issue will become less and less acute.

1. Manifestation: extent of manifestation

Recommendation 1.1. Convert Manifestation: extent of manifestation to a superelement. Many current instructions will become string encoding schemes in Community Resources and other instructions will be moved to new subelements of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

Approve.

2. Manifestation: extent of unitary structure

The discussion paper reads: "The plural form of a term is used when there is more than one unit." It is unclear if this is a statement of fact, a requirement, or a recommendation. There are languages, including those using construct state in their grammar, which do not allow for a plural by the use of an explicitly plural term. If this is merely prescriptive grammar valid for those languages in which it is valid and not base RDA, it should be made clear to translators and to different language communities that do not choose to use the official translation workflows that their own proper grammar may be used.

Recommendation 2.1. Add Manifestation: extent of unitary structure as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

Approve.

Recommendation 2.2. Create a new RDA Extent of Unitary Structure value vocabulary, which includes appropriate terms moved from RDA Carrier Extent Unit.

Approve.

3. Manifestation: extent of unit

The discussion paper's treatment of leaves as physical subunits and pages as layout terms provides a way to rectify historically unjust implications of "Misleading numbering" which, in current and previous versions of the Toolkit, can be seen as a pejorative statement about the traditional layouts of fundamental religious texts.

The paper continues the Anglo-American tradition of using "space X space" to stipulate the order of dimensions. It should be noted that there are still systems which find it difficult to process the use of a Latin character presented as a whole word (as indicated by the spaces before and after) along with a non-Latin script unit of length in the same statement.

Recommendation 3.1 Add Manifestation: extent of unit as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

Approve.

Recommendation 3.2. Add Manifestation: numbering of recording tracks as an element subtype of Manifestation: extent of unit. Move the instructions for Manifestation: tape configuration to this element.

Approve.

Recommendation 3.3. Move Manifestation: bibliographic format to become an element subtype of Manifestation: extent of unit.

Approve.

Recommendation 3.4. Move Manifestation: dimensions to become an element subtype of Manifestation: extent of unit. Update the instructions to reflect the focus on structured descriptions for two to three dimensions.

Approve.

4. Manifestation: extent of embodied content

Recommendation 4.1. Add Manifestation: extent of embodied content as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

Approve.

Recommendation 4.2. Add Manifestation: dimensions of embodied content as a subtype of Manifestation: extent of embodied content.

Approve.

Recommendation 4.3. Add Manifestation: designation of sound channels as a subtype of Manifestation: extent of embodied content. This partly replaces Manifestation: configuration of playback channels.

Approve.

Recommendation 4.4. Add Manifestation: number of sound channels as a subtype of Manifestation: extent of embodied content. This partly replaces Manifestation: configuration of playback channels.

Approve.

Recommendation 4.5. Replace Manifestation: configuration of playback channels with Manifestation: designation of sound channels and Manifestation: number of sound channels.

Approve.

Recommendation 4.6. Add Manifestation: reduce ratio as a subtype of Manifestation: extent of embodied content.

Approve.

Recommendation 4.7. Add Manifestation: image resolution of as a subtype of Manifestation: extent of embodied content.

Approve.

Recommendation 4.8. Create an RDA Layout of Embodied Content value vocabulary. Alternatively expand the RDA Layout value vocabulary to include terms that could be used in Manifestation: extent of embodied content.

Approve.

Recommendation 4.9. Add the terms column, frame, and page to a value vocabulary for layout of embodied content.

Approve.

In addition to consulting with rare book, music, and other special collections communities about further development of this vocabulary, religious communities should be consulted as well. For example, "line" is a common unit of extent in the Jewish scribal and manuscripts communities.

5. Manifestation: extent of aggregated content

Colour content is often noted alongside the relevant illustrative content. It is unclear if this would still be possible under the recommended changes. Communities may find it important to continue to note the color content of specific aggregated content/illustrative content and not a single value of the entire expression or manifestation.

Whether the vocabulary of Manifestation: illustrative content is soft-deprecated or left as is, it would be prudent to reconcile the differing definitions of "map" and "photograph" which appear in the current vocabulary and in the proposed one.

Recommendation 5.1. Add Manifestation: extent of aggregated content as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

Approve.

Recommendation 5.2. Create a value vocabulary for RDA Extent of Aggregated Content, which will include applicable terms moved from RDA Carrier Extent Unit and RDA Format of Notated Music. Alternatively expand the RDA Content Type value vocabulary to include terms that could be used in Manifestation: extent of embodied content.

Approve, with the following caveat:

It is unclear why "performed music" is to be changed to "performed song." There are languages in which the term for "song" is almost inextricably linked to the text and to poetry, leaving this term up to misinterpretation as a synonym for "spoken text."

6. Containers

Recommendation 6.1. Add Manifestation: number of containers as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

Approve.

Recommendation 6.2. Add Manifestation: dimensions of containers as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

Approve.

Recommendation 6.3. Add Manifestation: extent of storage space as a subelement of Manifestation: extent of manifestation. This element will only be used for collection manifestations.

Approve.

Recommendation 6.4. Create an RDA Container Type value vocabulary for case, portfolio, and other terms commonly used for containers.

Approve.

7. Manifestation statements for extent

Recommendation 7.1. Add a new manifestation statement element: Manifestation: manifestation extent statement.

Approve.

Recommendation 7.2. Add a new manifestation statement element: Manifestation: manifestation numbering of extent statement.

Approve.

Recommendation 7.3. Add a new set of RDA transcription guidelines “Guidelines on transcription of numbering of extent.” The guidelines will be derived from the current instructions in Manifestation: extent of manifestation related to transcribing the numbering of sequences of pages, leaves, etc.

Approve.

8. Manifestation: note on manifestation

Recommendation 8.1. Review instructions and examples that may need to be added to Manifestation: note on manifestation after reworking the other extent of manifestation elements.

Approve.

9. Expression: extent of expression

Recommendation 9.1. Update the definition of Expression: extent of expression to parallel the definition of Manifestation: extent of manifestation.

10. Work: extent of representative expression

Recommendation 10.1. Update the definition of Work: extent of representative expression.

Approve.

11. Expression: duration

Recommendation 11.1. No change to Expression: duration is recommended.

Approve.

12. Work: duration of representative expression

Recommendation 12.1. No change to Work: duration of representative expression is recommended.

Approve.

13. Other issues

Recommendation 13.1. Remove atlas from the value vocabularies for extent in RDA.

The paper makes a convincing case for removing the term from the extent vocabulary, however "atlas" is still a useful concept and the alternative of adding a genre term takes that concept out of scope of RDA, It would be useful to find somewhere to explicate the concept of an atlas as a specific type of gathered cartographic materials.

Recommendation 13.2.1. No change to the definition of sheet is recommended.

Approve.

Recommendation 13.2.2. Update the definition of folded sheet and move the term to the new RDA Extent of Unitary Structure value vocabulary.

Approve.

Recommendation 13.2.3. No change to the definition of gathering is recommended.

Approve.

Recommendation 13.2.4. Update the definition of leaf and remove the term from value vocabularies in RDA for carrier extent units. The term leaf will remain as a glossary term and used as a value for Manifestation: extent of unit.

Approve.

Recommendation 13.2.5. No change to the definition of double leaf is recommended.

Approve.

Recommendation 13.2.6. Add folded leaf to the glossary, treating the term like a folded sheet, but bound in a volume.

Approve.

Recommendation 13.2.7. Update the definition of updating loose-leaf.

Approve.

Recommendation 13.2.8. Add panel to the glossary, treating the item similar to leaf as a unit of extent derived from a sheet that has been folded.

Approve.

Recommendation 13.2.9. No change to the definition of plate is recommended.

Approve.

Recommendation 13.2.10. Move the term page to a value vocabulary for layout of embodied content and update the definition.

Approve.

Recommendation 13.2.11. Move the term column to a value vocabulary for layout of embodied content and update the definition.

Approve.

Recommendation 13.3. Add the new term photographic print to the RDA Extent of Unitary Structure value vocabulary and add the term photograph to the Extent of Aggregated Content value vocabulary. The use of the term photograph in illustrative content will require a future decision for that value vocabulary for the kinds of expressions embodied in augmentation aggregates.

Approve of the idea, not the specifics,

1. If I understand photography correctly, when a lens is involved (and it is not always), light passes through the lens and reaches the recording medium, That medium is very often not the sheet being cited in the proposed definition.
2. I am uncomfortable leaving two different definitions of the same term (photograph) in the Toolkit until some later, undetermined date (see above, section 5).

Recommendation 14.1. Remove RDA Carrier Extent Unit value vocabulary from the Toolkit after decisions are made for each current term.

Approve.

Recommendation 14.2. Review RDA Format of Notated Music value vocabulary from the Toolkit after decisions are made for each existing term. Terms linked to other extent vocabularies will include a scope note for manifestations embodying notated music.

Approve.