

**To:** RDA Steering Committee  
**From:** Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative  
**Subject:** RDA models for provenance data

ALA thanks the Technical Working Group for their analysis and recommendations surrounding accommodating provenance data in RDA. We support the recommendations and offer additional comments on the proposed changes.

### **General comment**

ALA believes that there are two types of provenance data “notes”: one intended for all users and one intended as non-public notes for other cataloguers. The latter is currently encompassed by “Cataloguer’s Note”. We recommend clarifying this situation in the scope sections; see below for suggested wording.

### **Technical Working Group Recommendations**

- 1. Further development of *date of usage*, *scope of usage*, *status of identification*, and *undifferentiated name indicator* should be considered as part of the development of the LRM Nomen entity in RDA.**

ALA agrees, although we would appreciate an explanation of how “undifferentiated name indicator” plays out as a Nomen property.

- 2. Generalize the scope of application of *cataloguer’s note* and *source consulted* to any RDA element and provide contextual guidance on applicability to specific elements.**

Overall, ALA believes this approach makes sense. However, as mentioned above, we would like to see a distinction made between public and non-public “notes”.

- 3. Consider creating the meta-elements *transcription note*, *transcription source*, and *transcription rules* when introducing separate elements for transcriptions.**

ALA agrees. This will be especially useful for those cataloguing rare materials, and we think that these meta-elements will be desirable in a linked data environment.

We have identified additional issues for further exploration:

- Can the *transcription rules* meta-element apply to the individual transcribed element, the entire “RDA Manifestation Data Set” (manifestation description), or both?
- If *transcription source* is created, will cataloguers consistently need to indicate the source as the title page?

#### **4. Develop general guidance on recording provenance data and using RDA meta-elements.**

ALA agrees, although we observe that sometimes it will not be possible to express these properties through a VES.

### **Technical Working Group Proposed Changes**

#### **1. Recommended new instructions at RDA 0.13-0.14**

##### *0.13, Source Consulted*

ALA supports the addition of this instruction, and the removal of the specific instructions for “source consulted” in the rest of RDA. We offer the following comments and suggestions on the proposed text.

##### *0.13.1.2, Sources of Information*

Although the wording in 0.13.1.2 is used in all of the existing RDA “source consulted” elements (5.8.1.2, 8.12.1.2, 24.7.1.2, and 29.6.1.2), this boilerplate language is actually difficult to parse. We think that this instruction is trying to state that essentially any resource can be consulted, and that the information recorded can come from anywhere in that resource. We have suggested revised wording below to help clarify this instruction.

##### *0.13.1.3, Recording Sources Consulted*

We have a number of concerns about the Optional additions in 0.13.1.3:

- The creation of the first optional addition is troubling; we strongly recommend that this be retained as part of the main instruction. We believe that the real purpose of providing information about the source consulted is to record the data found – not just to provide a brief citation for the source consulted.
- We note that there are very specific instructions regarding order in these optional additions. In light of RSC/Europe/3, we wonder if a mandated order is necessary. We have suggested wording below that eliminates the instructions for a particular order.
- The second optional addition does not appear to be a true addition; instead it is a separate recording of a consulted source that provides no useful information. We recommend retaining this text, but placing it as the last “main” paragraph in the instruction.

Proposed revision

*Marked-up copy (base text, Working Group proposal)*

## 0.13 Source Consulted

### 0.13.1 Basic Instructions on Recording Sources Consulted

#### 0.13.1.1 Scope

A **source consulted** ▼ is a resource used in determining an identifying attribute of an entity or in determining a relationship between entities.

Source consulted may occur in association with:

data identifying works, expressions, manifestations, items, persons, families, and corporate bodies

relationships between works, expressions, manifestations, or items

relationships between persons, families, or corporate bodies-

relationships between persons/families/corporate bodies and works/expressions/manifestations/items.

#### 0.13.1.2 Sources of Information

Take information for recording a ~~an~~ source consulted from any source.

#### 0.13.1.3 Recording Sources Consulted

Cite a source used to determine an identifying attribute of an entity or a relationship between entities.

##### EXAMPLE

[at least one example for manifestation or item]

Advances in cable-supported bridges, [2006]

Le sport dans l'antiquité, [2004]

Internet movie database, viewed on June 10, 2008

### *Optional Additions*

Identify the specific location within the source where the information was found, and provide ~~followed by~~ a brief statement of the information found.

#### EXAMPLE

Le sport dans l'antiquité, [2004]: title page (Jean-Paul Thuillier) spine (J-P. Thuillier)

An Act to Improve the International Commerce Transportation System of the United States, 1984: page 1 (citation title: Shipping Act of 1984)

Wikipedia, viewed December 2, 2007 (Howard Fast; Howard Melvin Fast (11 November 1914, New York City–12 March 2003, Old Greenwich, Connecticut) was a Jewish American novelist and television writer, who wrote also under the pen names E.V. Cunningham and Walter Ericson)

Cite other sources that were consulted but provided no useful information. Record *No information found* ~~following~~ along with the citation for the source consulted.

#### EXAMPLE

Who's who in France, 2006/07 (No information found)

Anonymous classics : a list of uniform headings for European literatures, 2004 (No information found)

Grove music online, searched December 8, 2007 (No information found)

### *Clean copy*

## 0.13 Source Consulted

### 0.13.1 Basic Instructions on Recording Sources Consulted

#### 0.13.1.1 Scope

A **source consulted** ▼ is a resource used in determining an identifying attribute of an entity or in determining a relationship between entities.

Source consulted may occur in association with:

data identifying works, expressions, manifestations, items, persons, families, and corporate bodies

relationships between works, expressions, manifestations, or items

relationships between persons, families, or corporate bodies-

relationships between persons/families/corporate bodies and works/expressions/manifestations/items.

### 0.13.1.2 Sources of Information

Take information for recording a source consulted from any source.

### 0.13.1.3 Recording Sources Consulted

Cite a source used to determine an identifying attribute of an entity or a relationship between entities.

#### EXAMPLE

[at least one example for manifestation or item]

Advances in cable-supported bridges, [2006]

Le sport dans l'antiquité, [2004]

Internet movie database, viewed on June 10, 2008

Identify the specific location within the source where the information was found, and provide a brief statement of the information found.

#### EXAMPLE

Le sport dans l'antiquité, [2004]: title page (Jean-Paul Thuillier) spine (J-P. Thuillier)

An Act to Improve the International Commerce Transportation System of the United States, 1984: page 1 (citation title: Shipping Act of 1984)

Wikipedia, viewed December 2, 2007 (Howard Fast; Howard Melvin Fast (11 November 1914, New York City–12 March 2003, Old Greenwich, Connecticut) was a Jewish American novelist and television writer, who wrote also under the pen names E.V. Cunningham and Walter Ericson)

Cite other sources that were consulted but provided no useful information. Record *No information found* along with the citation for the source consulted.

#### EXAMPLE

Who's who in France, 2006/07 (No information found)

Anonymous classics : a list of uniform headings for European literatures, 2004 (No information found)

Grove music online, searched December 8, 2007 (No information found)

### ***0.14, Cataloguer's Note***

ALA also supports the creation of this instruction, and the removal of the specific instructions for Cataloguer's Note throughout the rest of RDA. We have some additional comments and recommendations.

As mentioned in our general comment above, ALA believes that RDA should make a distinction between public and non-public notes. We recommend including language in 0.14.1.1, *Scope*, to indicate that the information recorded in this element is of particular use to cataloguers.

ALA observes that by collapsing all of the existing instructions here, but only basing the new instruction on the wording from Chapters 5 and 8, the concepts in Chapters 24 and 29 have been omitted. To address this problem, we recommend adding a second paragraph to 0.14.1.3, *Making Cataloguer's Notes*, based on the existing text in 24.8.1.3 and 29.7.1.3.

Finally, ALA recommends expanding the examples to include a "not the same as" or a "do not confuse with" example.

Proposed revision

*Marked-up copy (base text, Working Group proposal) – no clean copy provided*

## 0.14 Cataloguer's Note

### 0.14.1 Basic Instructions on making Cataloguer's Notes

#### 0.14.1.1 Scope

A **cataloguer's note** ▼ is an annotation that clarifies the selection and recording of identifying attributes, relationship data, or access points for the entity, intended to provide guidance for cataloguers in evaluating the information recorded.

Cataloguer's note may occur in association with:

data identifying works, expressions, manifestations, items, persons, families, and corporate bodies

data used for the construction of access points for works, expressions, persons, families, and corporate bodies

relationships between works, expressions, manifestations, or items

relationships between persons, families, or corporate bodies

relationships between persons/families/corporate bodies and works/expressions/manifestations/items.

### 0.14.1.2 Sources of Information

Take information for use in cataloguer's notes from any source.

### 0.14.1.3 Making Cataloguer's Notes

Make a cataloguer's note if the information is considered important for clarification or justification.

Make any notes that might be helpful to a cataloguer using or revising the relationship data, or creating an authorized access point for a related person, family, or corporate body.

#### EXAMPLE

[at least one example for manifestation or item]

Author prefers that Chinese form of name (Li Zhongqing) be used in access points for resources in Chinese and that English form (James Z. Lee) be used for resources in English

The words "Vocal works," "Orchestral works," etc., appearing on the container are considered an aid to retail store presentation and not a subseries

Relationship between Robert Shaw Festival Chorus and Robert Shaw Festival Singers unknown

Commonly known in film reference sources under title Mon oncle

For resources issued before the latter part of 1950 use Housing Authority of the City of Seattle; for resources issued in late 1950 or after use Seattle Housing Authority

Authority record coded "provisional" because Uzbek form of name unavailable

Do not confuse with the conductor and musicologist: Haas, Karl, 1900-1970

Do not confuse with the radio personality and writer on music: Haas, Karl

## 2. Recommended revisions for referencing RDA 0.13-0.14

### 2a1: General wording

### 2a2: Contextualized wording

### 2b: Wording for each element

To appropriately assess this proposed change, ALA would have appreciated seeing the suggested text for Chapter 1, which is only mentioned in passing in the first paragraph

under Change 2a. We have a general sense of what this would say, but the actual wording and placement remain unclear.

ALA commenters generally prefer option 2a2 over the other approaches, but we can also support option 2a1.

However, in relation to both of these options, we do not agree with the proposed removal of RDA 18.6. This instruction does not appear to be transferred anywhere else as a result of this proposal. We believe that the notes on manifestation attributes listed in 18.6 are useful as public notes, and thus are not encompassed by the instructions for a cataloguer's note.

ALA does not support option 2b. However, if the RSC prefers this approach, we wonder if additional clarification is needed to distinguish what would be recorded based on the proposed final paragraph of 2.8.2.1 and the current 2.17.7, *Note on Publisher Statement*.