

**To:** RDA Steering Committee  
**From:** Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative  
**Subject:** Revision of RDA 3.4.5 Extent of Text

ALA thanks the Rare Materials Working Group for this proposal to revise RDA 3.4.5 to better accommodate early printed resources and rare resources. We generally support the proposal, but we have a number of comments and suggested revisions.

### **Issue #1: Apply the exceptions also to “rare printed resources”**

#### *Comment*

ALA agrees with the Working Group’s recommendation to include rare resources.

We note that the text presented for changes to the Exception in 3.4.5.8 includes the phrase “if it can be readily ascertained”. To the best of our knowledge, this has never been part of RDA, and it is not indicated in the proposal as an addition by the Working Group. We assume, therefore, that this addition is not actually being suggested.

#### *Recommended change*

To correspond with RSC/RareWG/1/ALA response, we propose using the phrase “rare resources” instead of “rare printed resources” throughout this text.

### **Issue #2: Exception for early printed resources in 3.4.5.2**

- ***Part [b], Foliated volumes with text on both sides***

#### *Comment*

ALA agrees with the Working Group that there is nothing “misleading” about foliation for a volume with printing on both sides. However, we believe that is true in all cases, not just for early and rare resources. In fact, ALA has previously expressed concerns about RDA 3.4.5.5. We find that the first example “48 leaves, that is, 96 pages” does not exemplify the instruction. This is not a case of misleading numbering; it is simply numbering the leaves instead of the pages.

#### *Recommended changes*

With this perspective, ALA proposes a different solution.

1. We do not support the addition of the exception in 3.4.5.5. Instead, we strongly recommend removing the first example:

~~48 leaves, that is, 96 pages~~

~~Numbered leaves with text on both sides~~

With this example removed, this instruction will only apply to truly misleading numbering. If cataloguers wish to provide a note about a foliated volume that has text on both sides, RDA 3.21.2.11 , *Other Details of Extent*, covers this situation.

2. Modify the existing third paragraph of 3.4.5.2, to remove the reference to 3.4.5.5.

*Marked-up copy* (base text: RDA)

If the volume is numbered as leaves but has text on both sides, ~~see 3.4.5.5~~ or make an explanatory note (see 3.21.2.11).

*Clean copy*

If the volume is numbered as leaves but has text on both sides, make an explanatory note (see 3.21.2.11).

3. Modify the existing final paragraph of 3.4.5.9.1, to remove the reference to 3.4.5.5.

*Marked-up copy* (base text: RDA)

If the plates are numbered as leaves but have content on both sides,;  
record the extent by applying the instructions at 3.4.5.5  
~~or~~  
make an explanatory note (see 3.21.2.11).

*Clean copy*

If the plates are numbered as leaves but have content on both sides, make an explanatory note (see 3.21.2.11).

- ***Part [a], “Terms and form presented” (3.4.5.2 exception)***

*Comment*

ALA agrees with the proposed rewording of the 4<sup>th</sup> paragraph of 3.4.5.2.

- ***Part [c], Expand the extent or make a note (3.4.5.2 exception)***

*Comment*

ALA agrees with the Working Group’s analysis and solution.

### Issue #3: Accounting for extent as issued by the publisher (3.4.5.2, new exception)

#### Comments

ALA has a number of concerns about the new exception.

1. Style considerations: If a new exception is added that is specific to early and rare resources, a characterizing phrase would also be needed for the first exception. Perhaps “Complicated or irregular paging, etc.” would suffice.
2. The phrasing proposed for the new exception in 3.4.5.2 has some problems.
  - a. The first sentence is 37 words long and is hard to parse. This is especially true of “... record the number of pages, leaves, or columns for every leaf...”.
  - b. The first sentence could be simplified by relying on the main instruction to provide the details about recording “the number of pages, leaves, or columns”. This change would enable the exception to focus on accounting for the information about each “sheet” in the resource. Using this umbrella term would enable some simplification in the wording of this exception.
  - c. ALA wonders if the use of “volume” in the first sentence is too restrictive. An agency might wish to record detailed pagination information about an unbound early or rare resource.
3. How does the new exception in 3.4.5.2 relate to the exception for early printed resources (etc.) in 3.4.5.8? We believe that they should either use the same phrasing or that the exception in 3.4.5.8 simply refer to 3.4.5.2, Exception. If the latter approach is used, the final example in 3.4.5.8 should be moved to support the new exception in 3.4.5.2.

#### Recommended changes

1. Modify the proposed second set of exceptions in 3.4.5.2.

*Marked-up copy* (base text: Working Group proposal):

#### *Exceptions*

Complicated or irregular paging, etc. For complicated or irregular paging, etc., see 3.4.5.8.

Early printed resources resource and or rare printed resources resource. For an early printed resources resource and or a rare printed resources resource, record account for every sheet in the resource as issued by the publisher, including text, plates and blank sheets. the number of pages, leaves or columns for every leaf in the volume as issued by the publisher, including leaves of text, leaves of plates, and blank leaves. Do not record sheets leaves added as part of the binding or the binding itself. Record more precise information about pagination, blank leaves, or other aspects of collation in a note, if considered important for identification or selection (see 3.21.2.9).

**EXAMPLE**

12 unnumbered leaves, 74 leaves, 32 unnumbered leaves, 62 columns, 9 unnumbered pages

*Clean copy:*

*Exceptions*

*Complicated or irregular paging, etc.* For complicated or irregular paging, etc., see [3.4.5.8](#).

*Early printed resource or rare resource.* For an early printed resource or a rare resource, account for every sheet in the resource as issued by the publisher, including text, plates and blank sheets. Do not record sheets added as part of the binding or the binding itself. Record more precise information about pagination, blank leaves, or other aspects of collation in a note, if considered important for identification or selection (see [3.21.2.9](#)).

**EXAMPLE**

12 unnumbered leaves, 74 leaves, 32 unnumbered leaves, 62 columns, 9 unnumbered pages

2. Modify the existing exception in 3.4.5.8.

*Marked-up copy* (base text: Current RDA text):

*Exception*

*Early printed ~~resources~~ resource and or rare ~~printed resources~~ resource.* For an early printed ~~resources~~ resource and or a rare printed ~~resources~~ resource, see the second exception at [3.4.5.2](#), ~~record the paging, etc., in the form and sequence presented.~~

**EXAMPLE**

12 unnumbered leaves, 74 leaves, 32 unnumbered leaves, 62 columns, 9 unnumbered pages

*Clean copy*

*Exception*

*Early printed resource or rare resource.* For an early printed resource or a rare resource, see the second exception at [3.4.5.2](#).

**Issue #4: Inessential matter (3.4.5.3.2)**

*Comments*

ALA believes that the proposed revisions introduce some extraneous wording and complicate the existing instruction. For example, the additional text proposed for category c) appears to conflate two separate conditions, which would be better addressed by introducing a new “catchall” category at the end. In addition, we believe that category b) can be further simplified.

### *Recommended changes*

*Marked-up copy* (base text: Current RDA text):

#### 3.4.5.3.2 Inessential Matter

Disregard unnumbered sequences of inessential matter (advertising, blank pages, etc.).

##### *Exception*

*Early printed ~~resources~~ resource and or rare printed ~~resources~~ resource.* For an early printed ~~resources~~ resource and or a rare printed ~~resources~~ resource, record ~~pages containing advertisements~~ numbered or unnumbered sequences of inessential matter (when this can be done succinctly) if those ~~pages~~ sequences are:

a) included in the same pagination sequence as the text

*or*

b) printed on a ~~the pages of an initial or final gathering~~ also containing leaves or pages of text

*or*

c) printed on a separate gathering in a resource that is continuously signed, connected by a catchword, etc.

*or*

d) otherwise integral to the manifestation.

### *Clean copy*

#### 3.4.5.3.2 Inessential Matter

Disregard unnumbered sequences of inessential matter (advertising, blank pages, etc.).

##### *Exception*

*Early printed resource or rare resource.* For an early printed resource or a rare resource, record numbered or unnumbered sequences of inessential matter (when this can be done succinctly) if those sequences are:

a) included in the same pagination sequence as the text

*or*

b) printed on a gathering also containing leaves or pages of text

*or*

c) printed on a separate gathering in a resource that is continuously signed, connected by a catchword, etc.

*or*

d) otherwise integral to the manifestation.