

**To:** Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA  
**From:** Dave Reser, LC Representative  
**Subject:** Removing lists of terms from the Medium of Performance (6.15) instructions

LC appreciates the efforts of the JSC Music Working Group to remove the use of specific terms in the Medium of Performance instructions, and move some guidelines to the Tools tab. We believe these changes will make the instructions more attractive to a wider audience of RDA users.

We note that the terms at 6.15.1.5 are not a "closed list," and they were only ever intended to serve as a guide for how terms might be recorded. Thus, there is nothing in the instructions now from preventing any agency from using whatever list of terms for medium of performance it wants.

While we generally support the changes proposed (see additional comments below), we question whether these changes should be made now, or whether the changes should wait until the resolution of the issues presented in 6JSC/MusicWG/Discussion/2 (Simplification of the Medium of Performance Instructions (6.15)). Our preference at this point is to wait for a more permanent solution, but we look forward to discussing these options.

Our comments below cover three general topics:

- Removing even more of the prescribed terms that the Working Group thinks should be avoided
- Providing some additional references to 6.15.1.3
- Allowing for some alternatives to record individual instruments "in addition to or instead of" ensembles.

Our mark-up within the comments is shown from the current version of the instructions in the Toolkit, not the text in the MusicWG proposal.

### **Change #1: Revisions to 6.15**

#### **Comment 1:**

While we agree in principle, we suggest slight alterations of the new paragraph at 6.15.1.3:

Record medium of performance in a language preferred by the agency creating the data. Select terms from a standard list, if available. If such a list is not available, see the additional guidelines for recording medium of performance terms on the Tools tab of the RDA Toolkit: Medium of Performance.

**Rationale:** The text proposed for the Tools tab is not really a listing of medium of performance terms (although a few terms are given), the text is more accurately described as guidelines. Changes to the order of sentences (e.g., language before source of list) and phrases (e.g., "standard list" vs. "controlled list") reflect standard phrasing used in RDA at 11.8.1.3, 11.7.1.3, 6.11.1.3, 6.14.2.8.2, etc.

**Comment 2:**

The Exception at 6.15.1.3 still includes a prescriptive term (percussion); the concept could be described without that term:

***Exception***

If using a collective term for percussion instruments the term *percussion* is used (see 6.15.1.4), record the number of players if there is more than one.

**Rationale:** This provides greater flexibility for an agency that does not want to use the term *percussion* or its equivalent in another language.

**Comment 3:**

The first paragraph of the Exceptions at 6.15.1.4 still includes a prescriptive term (percussion); the concept could be described to avoid that term:

***Exceptions***

If there is more than one percussion instrument, and the names of the individual instruments are not specified by the composer in the original title, use *percussion* a collective term for the percussion instruments.

**Comment 4:**

We suggest adding a reference to the first proposed paragraph at 6.15.1.5:

Record an appropriate term for an instrument, following the instructions at 6.15.1.3.

**Comment 5:**

The first paragraph at 6.15.1.6 still includes a prescriptive term (ensemble); the concept could be described without that term for the same reasons we propose removing instructions about the term *percussion*:

Record an appropriate term ~~For~~ for an accompanying ensemble with one performer to a part; Use the appropriate term for the instrument or family of instruments, followed by a ~~the~~ word *ensemble* indicating an ensemble.

**Comment 6:**

The if/and/then statement at 6.15.1.6 still includes a prescriptive term (instrumental ensemble); the concept could be described without that term:

If:

an accompanying ensemble with one performer to a part consists of instruments from two or more families of instruments

and

a more specific term is not available for the ensemble as a whole

then:

record a collective term for the ensemble.

**Comment 7:**

We think that the Alternative at 6.15.1.6 could be made more permissive by allowing the recording of individual instruments in addition to, and not just instead of, a collective term.

***Alternative***

For Record an appropriate term for each instrument of an accompanying ensemble with one performer to a part, ~~record the appropriate term for each instrument of the accompanying ensemble instead of~~ or in addition to the name of the ensemble.

**Comment 8:**

While we agree to removing the prescribed list of terms to be recorded at 6.15.1.7 and renaming the instruction, we think that non-music specialists would benefit from the retention of some terms as parenthetical examples. We also suggest adding the word "collective":

Record an appropriate collective term For for instrumental music intended for ~~orchestra, string orchestra, or band~~ more than one performer to a part (e.g., orchestra, band, string orchestra), ~~record an appropriate term from the following list:~~

**Comment 9:**

We think an Alternative to identify the individual instruments in addition to or instead of the collective term should be added to 6.15.1.7.

***Alternative***

Record an appropriate term for each instrument instead of or in addition to the collective term.

**EXAMPLE**

string orchestra

violins (2)

viola

cello

double base

**Medium of performance recorded using the collective term and the terms for the individual instruments**

**Comment 10:**

We suggest adding a reference to 6.15.1.3 in the first paragraph of 6.15.1.9:

Record an appropriate term ~~from the following list to identify~~ for a type of solo voice, following the instructions at 6.15.1.3.

**Comment 11:**

We suggest adding a reference to 6.15.1.3 in the first paragraph of 6.15.1.10 (see Comment 10 above).

**Change #2: Guide for Medium of Performance on the Tools Tab**

We generally agree with the recommended changes for the Tools tab, but would appreciate a discussion of how the guidelines would be maintained (e.g., updating references to RDA instructions). We note that currently there are two models for this on the Tools Tab 1) the Books of the Bible on the Tools Tab (added and maintained by individual agencies) and 2) the RDA Mappings which are maintained by individual JSC members.