

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

From: Damian Iseminger, Chair, JSC Music Working Group

Subject: Revisions to Numeric Designation of a Musical Work (6.16)

Abstract

The proposal revises the instructions for numeric designations of a musical work. Changes proposed include: additional language for the definition of a numeric designation, guidance on language and form of number, clarification of instructions for identifying individual works with inclusive numbering, expanding the definition of what constitutes a serial number, clarification of the instructions for when the form of numeric designation differs from one work to another, and revising the instructions on thematic index numbers so that they appear less restrictive.

Justification

As part of its tasks for 2015, the Music Working Group was asked to examine the instructions at 6.16 and propose revisions, if needed. The Music Working Group identified several deficiencies and have proposed changes as detailed below.

Issues requiring resolution

There are several small issues that require resolution. In order to facilitate a better understanding, the issues are listed and numbered below.

Issue #1: Definition of Numeric Designation

In examining the instruction, the Music Working Group found the definition of numeric designation at 6.16.1.1 and in the glossary lacking because it did not include a definition of the elements of a numeric designation. For musical works, a numeric designation will always consist of a caption (e.g. no., op., BWV) and a number, whether that is a numeral, a word, or any other character. Even if the designation as found on the resource lacks a caption appearing with the number, the recording of the numeric designation will always include a caption. The proposed addition to the definition at 6.16.1.1 and the glossary makes this clear. See Change #1 and Change #5.

Issue #2: Language and Form of Number

6.16.1.3 contains no guidance on the language of the numeric designation and on the form of the number. 5.4 makes clear that chapter 6 instructions should contain guidance on language, when applicable. Because of this, a new paragraph containing language instructions has been added. In keeping with the pattern in RDA, the numeric designation is recorded in the language preferred by the agency creating the data. An alternative to this paragraph has also been proposed to use the language as found on the resource to accommodate U.S. practice.¹ If these changes are accepted, the 2nd block of examples in 6.16.1.3.1 will require revisions, since the final two examples would show the alternative practice proposed, not the main practice.

The instruction also provided no guidance on the form of number. A sentence has been added to 6.16.1.3 that refers users to 1.8 for the form of numeral.

There was some contention about the need to add any instructions for language. Some members felt that it was better to leave the guidance on language to individual agencies instead of enshrining into RDA a primary and an alternative practice.

For the changes detailed above, see Change #2.

Issue #3: Inclusive numbering and form of caption

In 6.16.1.3 paragraph 2, instructions are currently provided for inclusive numbering of an “aggregate work”. In practice, this instruction has led to confusion. Is it referring to a compilation or an individual work? To alleviate the confusion, “aggregate work” has been replaced by “individual work”, as that was the intention of the language when proposed in 2012 and added to RDA in July 2013.

Related to this is the form of the caption when inclusive numbering is used. Several Music Working Group members argued that while this instruction is superfluous for English users of RDA, having this guidance in place for translations of RDA, where a choice is available between singular and plural forms of a caption, would be helpful.

For the changes detailed above, see Change #2.

Issue #4: Recording serial number

The current instructions state that a serial number may only be recorded if the works share the same title and the same medium of performance. However there are many instances of works that have the same title and are numbered in series,

¹ This policy, however, was not applied in all cases. If the initial title element of a uniform title were in English, an English term for the numeric designation would be used, even if the designation as found on the resource was in a different language. Also, any language equivalent of the word “number” was rendered using the English abbreviation “no.”

but the medium of performance is different. To account for this, the proposal removes this restricting language on medium and title and simply says to record a serial number, if present.

For those cases where a number alone, without a caption, appears in a source, an instruction has been added to record the number as a cardinal number and to precede it with the abbreviation for number. The reason for this guidance is to preclude the possibility of having a serial number recorded as “5th” or “no. 5th” when the source for the serial number says “Fifth”.

The Music Working Group recommends that the examples be altered at 6.16.1.3 to remove the explanatory text for “Preferred title” and “Medium of performance”. Since the recording of serial number is no longer dependent on the same title and the same medium of performance, these explanatory notes are superfluous. The Music Working Group also recommends that additional examples be added for works that have distinctive titles and for instances where the medium is different between works with the same title, but numbered serially.

For the changes detailed above, see Change #3.

Issue #5: Different forms of serial numbers

The Music Working Group found the language for determining the form of serial number when it differs between the works in the series to be confusing. The text has been replaced with a two sentence paragraph instructing one to choose one form of numeric designation and use it for all works in the series. It should be noted that this addition assumes that the changes made to the definition for numeric designation of a musical work are accepted.

A note on the examples: the 1st two examples should have “book” abbreviated since the condition in 6.16.1.3 is to use abbreviations as instructed in Appendix B.5.4. The final two examples, as detailed in issue #2, will be need to changed to English examples if the proposed text for language is accepted.

For the changes detailed above, see Change #3.

Issue #6: Thematic index number

Some members of the Music Working Group felt that the initial sentence of 6.16.1.3.3 implied that only works of select composers should have thematic index numbers recorded. The restrictive language has been removed in the proposal. See Change #4.

Impact of the revisions

The proposed additions mostly clarify the current practice of recording serial, opus, and thematic index numbers for works and should have little impact on the work of current catalogers. There is one change that the Music Working Group could have made, but did not, and it concerns the use of abbreviations for captions in 6.16.1.3. In U.S. libraries, past and current practice has been to take the caption of the numeric designation as it appears on the source, whether in full or abbreviated, with the exception of the word *number*, which is always abbreviated. This practice contradicts the current instruction to use abbreviations as instructed in B.5.4. In the end, the Music Working Group decided not to propose changes to RDA to fit U.S. practice, because it was felt that the changes required would make the instruction overly complex.

Change #1: 6.16.1.1, Scope

Marked-up version

6.16.1.1 Scope

A **numeric designation of a musical work**▼ is a serial number, opus number, or thematic index number assigned to a musical work by a composer, publisher, or a musicologist.

A numeric designation of a musical work may include a numeral, a letter, a word, any other character, or a combination of these. A numeric designation is accompanied by a caption (*number, opus, BWV, etc.*).

Clean version

6.16.1.1 Scope

A **numeric designation of a musical work**▼ is a serial number, opus number, or thematic index number assigned to a musical work by a composer, publisher, or a musicologist.

A numeric designation of a musical work may include a numeral, a letter, a word, any other character, or a combination of these. A numeric designation is accompanied by a caption (*number, opus, BWV, etc.*).

Change #2: 6.16.1.3, Recording Numeric Designations of Musical Works

Marked-up version

6.16.1.3 Recording Numeric Designations of Musical Works

Record as many of the following numeric designations of musical works as can readily be ascertained.

Record the numeric designation in a language preferred by the agency creating the data if there is a satisfactory equivalent in that language.

Alternative

Record the numeric designation in the language in which it appears on the sources from which it is taken.

Apply the general guidelines on numbers expressed as numerals or as words at 1.8. Use abbreviations as instructed in appendix B (B.5.4). Use inclusive numbering for an aggregate individual work that is identified by consecutive serial numbers or thematic index numbers in music reference sources and/or thematic indexes. Record a caption accompanying inclusive numbering in the singular.

Record numeric designations of musical works as separate elements, as parts of access points, or as both. For instructions on recording a numeric designation of a musical work as part of the authorized access point, see 6.28.1.9–6.28.1.10.

Clean version

6.16.1.3 Recording Numeric Designations of Musical Works

Record as many of the following numeric designations of musical works as can readily be ascertained.

Record the numeric designation in a language preferred by the agency creating the data if there is a satisfactory equivalent in that language.

Alternative

Record the numeric designation in the language in which it appears on the sources from which it is taken.

Apply the general guidelines on numbers expressed as numerals or as words at [1.8](#). Use abbreviations as instructed in appendix B ([B.5.4](#)). Use inclusive numbering for an individual work that is identified by consecutive serial numbers or thematic index numbers in music reference sources and/or thematic indexes. Record a caption accompanying inclusive numbering in the singular.

Record numeric designations of musical works as separate elements, as parts of access points, or as both. For instructions on recording a numeric designation of a musical work as part of the authorized access point, see [6.28.1.9–6.28.1.10](#).

Change #3: 6.16.1.3.1, Serial Number

Marked-up version

6.16.1.3.1 Serial Number

~~If works with the same title and the same medium of performance are consecutively numbered in music reference sources, record~~ Record the serial number or numbers, if any. If a serial number has no caption associated with it, record the number as a cardinal number and precede it with the abbreviation for *number* (see appendix B [\(B.5.4\)](#)).

EXAMPLE

no. 2

~~Resource described:~~ String quartet no. 2 / Eleanor Cory. ~~Preferred title:~~ Quartets; ~~medium of performance:~~ violins (2), viola, cello

no. 5

~~Resource described:~~ Fifth symphony for orchestra / by Arnold Bax. ~~Preferred title:~~ Symphonies; ~~medium of performance:~~ orchestra

no. 6-8

~~Resource described:~~ Violin sonatas op. 30 nos. 1-3 / Beethoven. ~~Preferred title:~~ Sonatas; ~~medium of performance:~~ violin, piano; ~~opus number:~~ op. 30. ~~Beethoven's violin sonatas no. 6-8 also known as his opus 30, no. 1-3~~

[Retain current examples, with changes above. Additional example(s) needed for distinctive titles that have serial numbers]

if:

~~different works in a consecutively numbered series have different forms of numeric designation, or different words introducing the number~~
and

~~the different forms or words are in the same sources from which the numeric designations for the individual works are taken~~

~~then:~~

~~select one form of numeric designation and use it for all the works in the series.~~

In some cases, sources for a consecutively numbered series of works use different forms of numeric designation (i.e., ordinal and cardinal numbers or different captions). When this occurs, select one form of numeric designation and use it for all the works in the series.

EXAMPLE

1st ~~book~~ bk.

Resource described: The first set of songs : in four parts / composed by John Dowland ; scored from the first edition, printed in the year 1597, and preceded by a life of the composer by W. Chappell

2nd ~~book~~ bk.

Resource described: Second book of songs (1600) / John Dowland ; edited by Edmund H. Fellows ; revised by Thurston Dart

1o libro

Resource described: Il primo libro de ricercari da cantare : a quattro voci / di Claudio Merulo da Correggio

3o libro

Resource described: Ricercari da cantare : a quattro voci : libro terzo / di Claudio Merulo

[Additional examples or better explanations will be requested of the Examples Editor. The libro examples may have to be removed or replaced, depending on the dispensation of the language question.]

Clean version

6.16.1.3.1 Serial Number

Record the serial number or numbers, if any. If a serial number has no caption associated with it, record the number as a cardinal number and precede it with the abbreviation for *number* (see appendix B (B.5.4)).

EXAMPLE

no. 2

Resource described: String quartet no. 2 / Eleanor Cory.

no. 5

Resource described: Fifth symphony for orchestra / by Arnold Bax.

no. 6-8

Resource described: Violin sonatas op. 30 nos. 1-3 / Beethoven. **Beethoven's violin sonatas no. 6-8 also known as his opus 30, no. 1-3**

[Retain current examples, with changes above. Additional example(s) needed for distinctive titles that have serial numbers]

In some cases, sources for a consecutively numbered series of works use different forms of numeric designation (i.e., ordinal and cardinal numbers or different captions). When this occurs, select one form of numeric designation and use it for all the works in the series.

EXAMPLE

1st bk.

Resource described: The first set of songs : in four parts / composed by John Dowland ; scored from the first edition, printed in the year 1597, and preceded by a life of the composer by W. Chappell

2nd bk.

Resource described: Second book of songs (1600) / John Dowland ; edited by Edmund H. Fellows ; revised by Thurston Dart

1o libro

Resource described: Il primo libro de ricercari da cantare : a quattro voci / di Claudio Merulo da Correggio

3o libro

Resource described: Ricercari da cantare : a quattro voci : libro terzo / di Claudio Merulo

[Additional examples or better explanations will be requested of the Examples Editor. The libro examples may have to be removed or replaced, depending on the dispensation of the language question.]

Change #4: Thematic index number

Marked-up version

6.16.1.3.3 Thematic Index Number

~~In the case of certain composers, record~~ Record the number or numbers assigned to a work in a recognized thematic index. Precede the number or numbers by:

the initial letter or letters of the musicologist's name (e.g., K. 453¹)

or

a generally accepted abbreviation (e.g., BWV 232²).

EXAMPLE

D. 667

Resource described: Quintett in A für Klavier, Violine, Viola, Violoncello und Kontrabass D 667 (op. post. 114) : Forellen-Quintett = Quintet in A major for piano, violin, viola, violoncello, and double bass : the trout quintet / Franz Schubert ; herausgegeben von Arnold Feil. **Preferred title:** ~~Quintets~~; **medium of performance:** ~~piano, violin, viola, violoncello, double bass~~

H. III, 37-42

Resource described: 6 string quartets, opus 33, Hoboken III, 37-42 = 6 Streichquartette / Joseph Haydn ; edited by Simon Rowland-Jones ; editorial consultant, David Ledbetter. **Preferred title:** ~~Quartets~~; **medium of performance:** ~~violins (2), viola, cello~~; **opus number:** ~~op. 33~~

BWV 1046-1051

Resource described: Brandenburg concertos = Les concertos brandebourgeois / J.S. Bach. **Preferred title:** ~~Brandenburgische Konzerte~~

¹Ludwig Köchel, Chronologisch-thematisches Verzeichnis sämtlicher Tonwerke Wolfgang Amadé Mozart s, 8., unveränderte Aufl. (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1983, ©1964).

²Wolfgang Schmieder, Thematisch-systematisches Verzeichnis der musikalischen Werke von Johann Sebastian Bach, Bach-Werke-Verzeichnis (BWV). 3., unveränderte Aufl. (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel Musikverlag, 1961, ©1950).

Clean version

6.16.1.3.3 Thematic Index Number

Record the number or numbers assigned to a work in a recognized thematic index. Precede the number or numbers by:

the initial letter or letters of the musicologist's name (e.g., K. 453¹)

or

a generally accepted abbreviation (e.g., BWV 232²).

EXAMPLE

D. 667

Resource described: Quintett in A für Klavier, Violine, Viola, Violoncello und Kontrabass D 667 (op. post. 114) : Forellen-Quintett = Quintet in A major for piano, violin, viola, violoncello, and double bass : the trout quintet / Franz Schubert ; herausgegeben von Arnold Feil.

H. III, 37-42

Resource described: 6 string quartets, opus 33, Hoboken III, 37-42 = 6 Streichquartette / Joseph Haydn ; edited by Simon Rowland-Jones ; editorial consultant, David Ledbetter.

BWV 1046-1051

Resource described: Brandenburg concertos = Les concertos brandebourgeois / J.S. Bach. **Preferred title:** Brandenburgische Konzerte

¹Ludwig Köchel, Chronologisch-thematisches Verzeichnis sämtlicher Tonwerke Wolfgang Amadé Mozarts, 8., unveränderte Aufl. (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1983, ©1964).

²Wolfgang Schmieder, Thematisch-systematisches Verzeichnis der musikalischen Werke von Johann Sebastian Bach, Bach-Werke-Verzeichnis (BWV). 3., unveränderte Aufl. (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel Musikverlag, 1961, ©1950).

Change #5: Definition of numeric designation of a musical work

Marked-up version

Glossary

numeric designation of a musical work: A serial number, opus number, or thematic index number assigned to a musical work by a composer, publisher, or a musicologist. A numeric designation of a musical work may include a numeral, a letter, a word, any other character, or a combination of these. A numeric designation is accompanied by a caption (*number, opus, BWV, etc.*).

Clean version

Glossary

numeric designation of a musical work: A serial number, opus number, or thematic index number assigned to a musical work by a composer, publisher, or a musicologist. A numeric designation of a musical work may include a numeral, a letter, a word, any other character, or a combination of these. A numeric designation is accompanied by a caption (*number, opus, BWV, etc.*).

Other changes in RDA

This proposal does not affect other instructions or references to/from other instructions.

Changes to the RDA Element Set

The change in the definition of numeric designation of a musical work could cause revision to the definition of the work property “has numeric designation of a musical work”.