To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

From: Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative

Subject: Revisions to instructions for additions to access points representing musical works with distinctive titles (6.28.1.10 and 6.28.1.10.1)

ALA thanks the JSC Music Working Group for this proposal to offer greater flexibility in adding elements to access points for musical works. ALA agrees with the need to clarify these instructions.

Our response consists of two parts:
- rewording suggestions for portions of the Working Group's revisions, if the JSC prefers this solution
- a different approach to solving the problem, which ALA prefers.

Rewording suggestions – JSC Music Working Group's proposal

6.28.1.10 – Additions to Access Points Representing Musical Works with Distinctive Titles

ALA recommends the following, based on the Working Group's proposal:
- Specifying "a musical work" in the first paragraph.
- Changing the terminology from "Add one…" to "Add one or more…". This addition parallels the language in 6.27.1.9.
- Continuing to refer to these additions as "elements", rather than "categories".
- Continuing to refer to 6.28.1.9.1, rather than including a reference to 6.15 "as instructed at 6.28.1.9.1". To the best of our knowledge, this construction has no precedent in RDA, and the reference to 6.28.1.9.1 already leads the cataloger to the relevant instructions at 6.15.
- Including both form of work and other distinguishing characteristic of the work in the list, but as separate entries. By including both elements as optional additions, no immediate resolution is needed on the question of whether or not "piano music" is a form of work or another distinguishing characteristic.
- Removing the proposed exceptions:
  - Exception a) is addressed by the reference to 6.28.1.9.1. If it needs to be retained, language from 6.28.1.9.1, exceptions a.iii and a.iv should be used here.
  - ALA recommends treating exception b) as a separate paragraph within the main instruction, appearing just before the example box. We also recommend adding a relevant example that demonstrates omitting the medium of performance. We have suggested two examples, although we expect that better ones can be found.
  - ALA recommends making rewording exception c) so that it is a separate paragraph that refers to 6.28.1.10.1 (or possibly 6.28.1.10.1.a).
- Including the final paragraph proposed by the Working Group suggests, with the addition of the Oxford comma after "sufficient".

Marked-up copy - based on the current RDA instruction

6.28.1.10 Additions to Access Points Representing Musical Works with Distinctive Titles

Make additions to access points if needed to distinguish the access point <u>for a musical work:</u>
> from one that is the same or similar but represents a different work

or

> <u>from one that</u> represents a person, family, corporate body, or place.

Add one or more of the following elements, as appropriate:
> a) the medium of performance (see **6.28.1.9.1**)

~~*or*~~

> b) <u>the form of work (see **6.3**)</u>

<u>or</u>

> <u>c)</u> another distinguishing characteristic of the work (see **6.6**).

Use the same type of addition for each of the access points for different musical works with identical titles.

<u>Add these elements only if they distinguish among access points.</u>

> **EXAMPLE**
>
> Debussy, Claude, 1862–1918. Images, orchestra
>
> Debussy, Claude, 1862–1918. Images, piano
> *not* Debussy, Claude, 1862–1918. Images (Piano work)
>
> Granados, Enrique, 1867–1916. Goyescas (Opera)
>
> Granados, Enrique, 1867–1916. Goyescas (Piano work)
> *not* Granados, Enrique, 1867–1916. Goyescas, piano
>
> <u>***but***</u>
>
> <u>Brandt, Vasiliĭ. Konzertstück, no. 1</u>
> <u>***not*** Brandt, Vasiliĭ. Konzertstück, trumpet, piano, no. 1</u>
>
> <u>Brandt, Vasiliĭ. Konzertstück, no. 2</u>
> <u>***not*** Brandt, Vasiliĭ. Konzertstück, trumpet, piano, no. 2</u>

<u>If the work is part of a consecutively numbered series, and the serial numbers are more useful than these additions to identify the work, apply the instructions at **6.28.1.10.1.**</u>

<u>If the additions are not made, are not sufficient, or are not available to distinguish the access points, see **6.28.1.10.1.**</u>

Clean copy

6.28.1.10 Additions to Access Points Representing Musical Works with Distinctive Titles

Make additions to access points if needed to distinguish the access point for a musical work:

from one that is the same or similar but represents a different work

or

from one that represents a person, family, corporate body, or place.

Add one or more of the following elements, as appropriate:
   a)   the medium of performance (see 6.28.1.9.1)
   b)   the form of work (see 6.3)

or

c) another distinguishing characteristic of the work (see 6.6).

Use the same type of addition for each of the access points for different musical works with identical titles.

Add these elements only if they distinguish among access points.

> **EXAMPLE**
>
> Debussy, Claude, 1862–1918. Images, orchestra
>
> Debussy, Claude, 1862–1918. Images, piano
> *not* Debussy, Claude, 1862–1918. Images (Piano work)
>
> Granados, Enrique, 1867–1916. Goyescas (Opera)
>
> Granados, Enrique, 1867–1916. Goyescas (Piano work)
> *not* Granados, Enrique, 1867–1916. Goyescas, piano
>
> *but*
>
> Brandt, Vasiliĭ. Konzertstück, no. 1
> *not* Brandt, Vasiliĭ. Konzertstück, trumpet, piano, no. 1
>
> Brandt, Vasiliĭ. Konzertstück, no. 2
> *not* Brandt, Vasiliĭ. Konzertstück, trumpet, piano, no. 2

If the work is part of a consecutively numbered series, and the serial numbers are more useful than these additions to identify the work, apply the instructions at 6.28.1.10.1.

If the additions are not made, are not sufficient, or are not available to distinguish the access points, see 6.28.1.10.1.

6.28.1.10.1 – Further Additions …

ALA can generally accept these proposed revisions, although we note that the suggestion to separate the instructions in 6.28.1.10 into "additions" and "further additions" is what prompted our alternative approach below.

As to the Working Group's recommendations for this instruction:
• We are uncertain if the final sentence proposed for 6.28.1.10.1 needs to be repeated as the first paragraph here.
• While we understand an interest in retaining the specific terminology in the current wording of 6.28.1.10.1.c through 6.28.1.10.1.e, we observe that this does not match the RDA style of naming the relevant element. We can accept either keeping this wording or changing it to match the element names.

- We agree with the Working Group's separation of the references to 6.5 and 6.6 in this list.

Alternative approach – complete replacement of 6.28.1.10

ALA recommends removing the distinction between "additions" and "further additions" by retaining only a single instruction. We also believe that the specifics about the order in which to add elements, and any limitations on adding them, should be in application profiles, rather than in RDA itself. Thus our proposal below:

- Merges 6.28.1.10 and 6.28.1.10.1
- Lists potential additions in a lettered list, but does not otherwise provide "in this order" guidance.
- Refers to the main instructions, rather than the access point instructions, for everything except medium of performance. This is because substantial guidance regarding use of medium of performance in AAPs resides in 6.28, and not in 6.15.
- Uses the names of the elements, rather than providing more music-specific guidance in the lettered list.
- Adds the clause "such as the name of the first publisher" to the final entry on the list.
- Merges the existing examples in the two instructions into a single example box.

Marked-up copy - based on the current RDA instruction

6.28.1.10 Additions to Access Points Representing Musical Works with Distinctive Titles

Make additions to access points if needed to distinguish the access point <u>for a musical work:</u>
   from one that is the same or similar but represents a different work

or
   <u>from one that</u> represents a person, family, corporate body, or place.

Add one or more of the following elements, as appropriate:
   a)   ~~the~~ medium of performance (see **6.28.1.9.1**)

~~*or*~~
   b)   <u>form of work (see **6.3**)</u>
   c)   <u>numeric designation of a musical work (see **6.16**)</u>
   d)   <u>key (see **6.17**)</u>
   e)   <u>date of work (see **6.4**)</u>
   f)   <u>place of origin of the work (see **6.5**)</u>
   g)   <u>another distinguishing characteristic of the work (see **6.6**), such as the name of the first publisher</u>.

Use the same type of addition for each of the access points for different musical works with identical titles.

> **EXAMPLE**
> Debussy, Claude, 1862–1918. Images, orchestra

Debussy, Claude, 1862–1918. Images, piano
not Debussy, Claude, 1862–1918. Images (Piano work)

Granados, Enrique, 1867–1916. Goyescas (Opera)

Granados, Enrique, 1867–1916. Goyescas (Piano work)
not Granados, Enrique, 1867–1916. Goyescas, piano

6.28.1.10.1 Additions to Resolve Conflict

If the additions at 6.28.1.10 do not resolve the conflict, add one or more of the following:
a) a numeric designation (see 6.28.1.9.2)
b) key (see 6.28.1.9.3)
c) the year of completion of composition (see 6.4)
d) the year of original publication (see 6.4)

and/or

e) any other identifying element, such as place of composition (see 6.5), or the name of the first publisher (see 6.6).

EXAMPLE

Bach, Johann Sebastian, 1685–1750. Was Gott tut, das ist wohlgetan (Chorale prelude)

Bach, Johann Sebastian, 1685–1750. Was Gott tut, das ist wohlgetan (Cantata), BWV 98

Bach, Johann Sebastian, 1685–1750. Was Gott tut, das ist wohlgetan (Cantata), BWV 99

Clean copy

6.28.1.10 Additions to Access Points Representing Musical Works with Distinctive Titles

Make additions to access points if needed to distinguish the access point for a musical work:
from one that is the same or similar but represents a different work

or

from one that represents a person, family, corporate body, or place.

Add one or more of the following elements, as appropriate:
a) medium of performance (see 6.28.1.9.1)
b) form of work (see 6.3)
c) numeric designation of a musical work (see 6.16)
d) key (see 6.17)
e) date of work (see 6.4)
f) place of origin of the work (see 6.5)
g) another distinguishing characteristic of the work (see 6.6), such as the name of the first publisher.

Use the same type of addition for each of the access points for different musical works with identical titles.

EXAMPLE

Debussy, Claude, 1862–1918. Images, orchestra

Debussy, Claude, 1862–1918. Images, piano
not Debussy, Claude, 1862–1918. Images (Piano work)

Granados, Enrique, 1867–1916. Goyescas (Opera)

Granados, Enrique, 1867–1916. Goyescas (Piano work)
not Granados, Enrique, 1867–1916. Goyescas, piano

Bach, Johann Sebastian, 1685–1750. Was Gott tut, das ist wohlgetan (Chorale prelude)

Bach, Johann Sebastian, 1685–1750. Was Gott tut, das ist wohlgetan (Cantata), BWV 98

Bach, Johann Sebastian, 1685–1750. Was Gott tut, das ist wohlgetan (Cantata), BWV 99