To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

From: Dave Reser, LC Representative

Subject: Revision to RDA 3.1.4, Resources Consisting of More than One Carrier Type, ad RDA 3.4.1.3, Extent

Thanks to ALA for analyzing the content and limitations of RDA 3.1.4, and proposing solutions for that and other sections of Chapter 3. We agree that 3.1.4 has been perplexing at times, and contains more instruction than would be expected, including duplication with other content in the chapter. We also agree with ALA that the alternatives to record extent statements for only the predominant or most substantial carriers have been missing, which sets it in contrast to media type and carrier type where these alternatives are present.

We agree with ALA that 3.1.4 needs to remain in order to provide a useful summary of instructions directing catalogers to the appropriate instructions within Chapter 3. In effect, it can serve a function similar to other "table of contents" instructions at 6.2.2.3, 9.2.2.5, 2.8.1.5, etc. For the revision to 3.4.1.4, we strongly prefer ALA's Option 2. We dislike Option 1 because we think the sub-instructions at 3.1.4 for media type, carrier type, and extent are essentially just repeating the recording instructions for those elements. This seems confusing for the Toolkit user and unnecessarily repetitive. We appreciate the efforts to revise the 3.4 instructions, but see a few problems with the proposed revision itself—we have supplied alternative markup to solve those problems, that we believe are in the "spirit" of the revisions intended by ALA.

This is a summary of the differences between LC's proposed revisions and ALA's (Option 2 plus 3.4.1.3 revisions):

1.5.2 Revision
We propose to generalize the reference at 1.5.2. Since all of Chapter 3 is about describing carriers and many instructions from that chapter might be used in the description, we thought it was more appropriate to provide a general reference.

3.1.4 Revisions
We have based our revisions on ALA's Option 2. However, we prefer an ordered list for the elements following the instructions for long sentences in the Editor's Guide. In the 1st example box, we added media types to follow the instructions, and modified the example so that no carriers covered in the exceptions at 3.4.1.3 were used. We also modified the example in the Alternative to better reflect the instructions. We replaced the reference to 3.21.2.3 with a reference to 3.21. 3.21.2.3 is a specific instruction about when the extent is recorded as "various pieces" (covered in 3.4.1.5) so we believe that reference is not appropriate at this general instruction. Finally, we changed the reference to 27.1 to clarify that recording information about the relationship to other manifestations a technique used for *analytical description* of a resource, where the rest of the instructions are relevant to *comprehensive description*. We would prefer to delete the

reference to 27.1 since we believe it is unnecessary, but we can agree to keep it in the form we suggested.

3.4.1.3 Revisions
ALA's revision deletes all instructions at 3.4.1.3 in favor of the two proposed sub-instructions. This creates a need to repeat 5 paragraphs of instructions, the current Alternative, the current Exceptions, and the Optional Addition for the container (from 3.1.4.1) in both sub-instructions. We believe this is an unnecessary duplication of instructions. ALA's proposed 3.4.1.3.2 does not contain the Exceptions currently at 3.4.1.3 that need to be present. By placing the current Exceptions only at 3.4.1.3.1 (Resources Consisting of More than One Carrier), ALA has created a paradox. If the resource is one volume, then 3.4.5 applies. However, if the resource is 2 volumes, which is more than one carrier but only one carrier type, then the cataloger is not directed to 3.4.5, and therefore will never get to 3.4.5.17. The same problem applies if the resource is a score and an audio disc.

ALA did not mention 3.4.1.4-3.4.1.6 in its proposal. Although not labelled as such now, the instructions at 3.4.1.4-3.4.1.6 clearly refer only to resources with more than one carrier. Because of this, we feel they should be sub-instructions to an instruction called "Resources Consisting of More than One Carrier." LC could think of no instructions that would apply to "Resources Consisting of One Carrier" but not to "Resources Consisting of More than One Carrier" so we propose to have this organization of instructions:

3.4.1.3 Recording Extent
3.4.1.4 Resources Consisting of More Than One Carrier
[replaces current 3.4.1.4 Exact Number of Units Not Readily Ascertainable]
    3.4.1.4.1 Exact Number of Units Not Readily Ascertainable
    3.4.1.4.2 Units Cannot Be Named Concisely
    3.4.1.4.3 Units and Sets of Units with Identical Content
3.4.1.5 Units Cannot Be Named Concisely *[instruction deleted]*
3.4.1.6 Units and Sets of Units with Identical Content *[instruction deleted]*
3.4.1.7 Number of Subunits *[unchanged]*

We note that there is precedent in Chapter 3 for having "More Than One" instructions without a parallel "Single" instruction—see 3.4.4.3, 3.4.4.4, 3.5.1.6, and 3.5.1.7.

Change 1: Modify reference at 1.5.2. We have shown mark-up only.

Mark-up version:

1.5.2 Comprehensive Description
    [1st paragraph omitted]

When using a comprehensive description for a resource that has more than one part, record details about the parts of the resource in any of the following ways that are applicable:

a) as part of the description of the carrier (see <u>chapter 3</u> ~~3.1.4~~ RDA)
b) as a relationship to a related work (see **25.1** RDA)
c) as a relationship to a related manifestation (see **27.1** RDA).

Change 2, RDA 3.1.4: This is based on ALA's Option 2 with differences between the two highlighted. Differences include 1) an ordered list, 2) a general note instruction, and a modification to the reference to 27.1 so that it is the relationships technique (in this context) is for analytical description. **Note: we would also be agreeable to deleting the reference to 27.1.**

Clean copy only:

3.1.4 Resources Consisting of More Than One Carrier

When preparing a comprehensive description for a resource consisting of more than one carrier, record for each carrier:

a) media type (see 3.2)
b) carrier type (see 3.3)
c) extent (3.4).

EXAMPLE

computer
audio
unmediated
Media types for a resource consisting of a computer disc, an audio disc, 4 flipcharts, and a sheet

computer disc
audio disc
flipchart
sheet
Carrier types for the same resource

1 computer disc
1 audio disc
4 flipcharts
1 sheet
Extent of the same resource

Alternative

Record these elements only for:

a) the predominant carrier (if there is a predominant carrier)

or

b) the most substantial carriers (including the predominant carrier, if there is one).

> **EXAMPLE**
> video
> videodisc
> 3 videodiscs
> Predominant media type, carrier type, and extent recorded for a resource consisting of a set of videodiscs and a card

Record additional characteristics of particular carriers if considered important for identification or selection (see 3.5-3.20.)

For instructions on recording extent for a comprehensive description of a collection, see 3.4.1.11.

Make a note on carrier if considered important for identification or selection (see 3.21).

When preparing an analytical description for a resource consisting of more than one carrier, record information about another carrier as part of the description of the related manifestation (see 27.1).

Change 3: This shows changes based on the current version of 3.4.1.3 in the RDA Toolkit. It preserves the Alternative for a term in common usage and the Exceptions at the general instruction level, since those should apply no matter how many carriers are being described.

Mark-up version:

3.4.1.3 Recording Extent

Record the extent of the resource by giving the number of units and the type of unit. For the type of unit, use an appropriate term from the list of carrier types at 3.3.1.3. Record the term in the singular or plural, as applicable.
If:

the resource consists of more than one carrier type

and

information about the different carrier types is considered important for identification or selection

~~then:~~

    ~~record the extent by giving the number of units and the term for each carrier type.~~

<u>EXAMPLE</u>

<u>100 slides</u>
<u>2 audiotape reels</u>
<u>1 film reel</u>
<u>1 video cartridge</u>
<u>1 computer disc</u>
<u>1 online resource</u>
<u>3 microfiches</u>

Specify the number of subunits, if applicable (see 3.4.1.7–3.4.1.9).

~~EXAMPLE~~

~~1 microfilm cassette~~
~~100 slides~~
~~2 audiotape reels~~
~~1 film reel~~
~~1 video cartridge~~
~~1 computer disc~~
~~1 online resource~~
~~3 microfiches~~

Alternative

Use a term in common usage (including a trade name, if applicable) to indicate the type of unit:

a)   if the carrier is not in the list at 3.3.1.3.

or

b)   as an alternative to a term listed at 3.3.1.3, if preferred by the agency preparing the description.

EXAMPLE

audio slide
USB flash drive

If an applicable trade name or other similar specification is not used as the term for the type of unit, record that information as instructed at 3.20.1.3.

Exceptions

Cartographic resources. For a printed, manuscript, graphic, or three-dimensional resource consisting of cartographic content (with or without accompanying text and/or illustrations), see 3.4.2..

Notated music. For a printed or manuscript resource consisting of notated music (with or without accompanying text and/or illustrations), see 3.4.3.

Still images. For drawings, paintings, prints, photographs, etc., see 3.4.4.

Text. For resources consisting of printed or manuscript text (with or without accompanying illustrations), see 3.4.5.

Three-dimensional forms. For resources consisting of one or more three-dimensional forms, see 3.4.6.

<u>*Optional Addition*</u>

<u>If the carrier is in a container, name the container.</u>

<u>EXAMPLE</u>
<u>box</u>
<u>Container for a videocassette</u>

<u>Apply the additional instructions on resources consisting of more than one carrier at 3.4.1.4.</u>

<u>For incomplete resources, see 3.4.1.10.</u>

~~For resources consisting of more than one type of carrier, see 3.1.4.~~

<u>Clean copy:</u>

3.4.1.3 Recording Extent

Record the extent of the resource by giving the number of units and the type of unit. For the type of unit, use an appropriate term from the list of carrier types at 3.3.1.3. Record the term in the singular or plural, as applicable.

EXAMPLE
100 slides
2 audiotape reels
1 film reel
1 video cartridge
1 computer disc
1 online resource
3 microfiches

Specify the number of subunits, if applicable (see 3.4.1.7–3.4.1.9).

Alternative

Use a term in common usage (including a trade name, if applicable) to indicate the type of unit:

   a) if the carrier is not in the list at 3.3.1.3.
   or
   b)   as an alternative to a term listed at 3.3.1.3, if preferred by the agency preparing the description.

EXAMPLE
audio slide
USB flash drive

If an applicable trade name or other similar specification is not used as the term for the type of unit, record that information as instructed at 3.20.1.3.

Exceptions

   Cartographic resources. For a printed, manuscript, graphic, or three-dimensional resource consisting of cartographic content (with or without accompanying text and/or illustrations), see 3.4.2..

   Notated music. For a printed or manuscript resource consisting of notated music (with or without accompanying text and/or illustrations), see 3.4.3.

   Still images. For drawings, paintings, prints, photographs, etc., see 3.4.4.

   Text. For resources consisting of printed or manuscript text (with or without accompanying illustrations), see 3.4.5.

   Three-dimensional forms. For resources consisting of one or more three-dimensional forms, see 3.4.6.

Optional Addition

If the carrier is in a container, name the container.

EXAMPLE
box
Container for a videocassette

Apply the additional instructions on resources consisting of more than one carrier at 3.4.1.4.

For incomplete resources, see 3.4.1.10.

Change 4: This shows our proposed replacement for 3.4.1.4, and the deletion of content at 3.4.1.5-3.4.1.6 based on the model at 7.23.1. We have shown clean copy only.

Clean copy only:

3.4.1.4 Resources Consisting of More Than One Carrier

If the resource consists of more than one carrier, record the extent by giving the number of units and the term for each carrier.

> **EXAMPLE**
> 15 flipcharts
>
> 1 computer disc
> 1 audio disc
> **A resource consisting of a computer disc and an audio disc**

Alternative

Record only:

a) the extent of the predominant carrier (if there is a predominant carrier)

or

b) the extent of the most substantial carriers (including the predominant carrier, if there is one).

> **EXAMPLE**
> 5 microfilm reels
> **A resource consisting of microfilm reels with an accompanying booklet**

Apply these additional instructions, as applicable:

exact number of units not readily ascertainable (see 3.4.1.4.1)
units cannot be named concisely (see 3.4.1.4.2)
units and sets of units with identical content (see 3.4.1.4.3).

3.4.1.4.1 Exact Number of Units Not Readily Ascertainable

[instruction unchanged from current 3.4.1.4]

3.4.1.4.2 Units Cannot Be Named Concisely

[instruction unchanged from current 3.4.1.5]

3.4.1.4.3 Units and Sets of Units with Identical Content

[instruction unchanged from current 3.4.1.6]

3.4.1.5 Units Cannot Be Named Concisely
For instructions on recording the extent of a resource with units that cannot be named concisely, see 3.4.1.4.2.

3.4.1.6 Units and Sets of Units with Identical Content
For instructions on recording the extent of a resource with units and sets of units with identical content, see 3.4.1.4.2.

Change 5: Change reference in final paragraph of 3.4.2.2, 3.4.3.2, 3.4.4.2, and 3.4.6.2 (paragraph is identical in all instructions). We have shown mark-up only.

Mark-up version:

Apply these additional basic instructions, as applicable:
units or sets of units with identical content (see <u>3.4.1.4.3</u> ~~3.4.1.6~~)
incomplete resources (see 3.4.1.10)
comprehensive description of a collection (see 3.4.1.11)
analytical description of a part (see 3.4.1.12).

Change 6: Change reference in 3.4.5.22. We have shown mark-up only.

Mark-up version:

3.4.5.22 Units and Sets of Units with Identical Content
For a resource consisting of units or sets of units with identical content, apply the basic instructions at <u>3.4.1.4.3</u> ~~3.4.1.6~~).

Change 7: Revise final paragraph to accommodate deletion of 3.1.4.2. Note: even if either of ALA's options is approved by the JSC, this paragraph must be changed. Option 1 in ALA's proposal turns 3.1.4.2 into instruction for carrier type so dimensions are not included. Option 2 deletes 3.1.4.2. We have shown mark-up only.

Mark-up version:

3.5.1.6 Resources Consisting of More Than One Carrier
[paragraphs 1-5 and examples omitted]

For a resource consisting of more than one type of carrier, record the dimensions of <u>each carrier</u> ~~the carriers by applying the instructions at 3.1.4.2.~~

Change 8: Revise final paragraph to accommodate deletion of 3.1.4.3.Note: Even if ALA's Option 2 is approved by the JSC, this paragraph must be revised to accommodate the deletion of 3.1.4.3. We have shown mark-up only.

3.21.2.3 Describing Various Pieces

When applying the instructions at 3.4.1.4 ~~3.1.4.3, 3.4.1.5,~~ and 3.4.6.3, the extent of a resource can be recorded as *various pieces*. In such cases, make a note providing details of the pieces if considered important for identification or selection.

[example omitted]